

ISSN2278–0211(Online)

Regulating Monetary Federalism in Nigeria; an Appraisal of 2010-2015 Regimes

Dr. Josephine A. A. Agbonika

Senior Lecturer, Kogi State University, Anyigba Commissioner Tax Appeal Tribunal, South East Zone, Enugu, Nigeria

Adukwu Nasir Waltson

Policy and Financial Analyst, Capital Solicitors, No. 74 Karimu Street, Surulere, Lagos, Nigeria

Abstract:

Monetary federalism deals with the financial system policies of the various committees of the apex bank and the regulatory directives of the Central Bank of Nigeria and most crucially its implication on the fiscal policy trust of the Ministry of Finance. These two variables of political economy are supposed to be examined from the perspectives of official data from the National Bureau of Statistics. Today there are conflicts in the coordination of data that have to do with the outcome and which of these units should be the umpire? Such that the three central bodies of the executive branch of government alone, that are of cardinal objectives to the country economic development namely the Ministry of Finance, Central Bank and National Bureau of Statistics, contradict themselves on information dealing with economic development, unemployment and citizens' welfare. In this work we shall appraise the monetary policy management issue and its impact on fiscal policy and vise versa. And the overall goal of public policy, national development and sustainable development.

1. Introduction

Theoretically there are two basic foundations (fiscal policy and payment system) upon which the financial thrust or the political economy of any system of government is built, these two basic foundations come under umbrella concepts known as systems of government and its complementary political economy. These systems and complementary political economies are; Federal System of government as complemented by fiscal federalism, Con-federal System functions with Con-federal fiscal policy and Unitary System of government with its complementary fiscal Unitarianism.

World over fiscal measure of government has long been limited to tax regimes and tax lawyers in the legal profession have been seen as the legal federalists. In this work we will beg to differ from dominant notions in Nigeria and some other jurisdictions, that fiscal federalism is limited to taxation, and that the theoretical issues are in the domain of accountants, economists and financial experts. In Nigeria, the problem of fiscal federalism does not lie in taxation, there are broad tax regimes, yet the practices are fairly unprogressive. Enforcement mechanism remains unitarian in nature and outcome. In Nigeria, the unitarian case study is a function of constitutional deficiencies. Our federal constitution is deficient in federal values, character and precepts.

The clear diversion or missing link between taxation and revenue generation/allocations and effective utilization is the regulatory framework for the effective derivation and maximization of the inherent and apparent benefits in tax derived revenue and the depth of natural recourses endowment. The foregoing lies more within the purview of regulatory and administrative lawyers. The domination of the regulatory aspects of our fiscal federalism by economists, accountants and other professions has limited the depth of regulatory outcome. To do justice to regulatory challenges of the federal system of government one has to be fairly knowledgeable on the extract frameworks, customary practices and a moderate appreciation of judicial duties with respect to the interpretation of laws.

We shall analyze the practice of monetary federalism juxtaposing it with regulatory deficiencies that had debilitated the monetary environment in view of strengthening awareness on regulatory studies and related research works.

2. Monetary Federalism

Monetary policy can be defined as that part of economic policies which regulate the level of money or liquidity in the country's economy in order to achieve some desired objectives such as inflation.¹

Monetary federalism is defined as the institutions', policies, framework and regimes of measure deployed by the Central Bank of Nigeria in exercise of her monetary regulation. It will also to a large extent be impacted on by the outcome of the fiscal trusts of the Ministry of Finance, another name for monetary federalism in Payment System.

www.doublegist.com>problems-of-monetary-and-fiscal-policies-in-nigeria

² Wikipedia.wiki.Federalism_in_Nigeria

The ombudsman or melting pot of these two fundamental and broad propositions is by design supposed to be visible in the activities of the National Bureau of Statistics. The bureau is by default expected to deploy statistical data in discharging its duties as the sole assessors of the sufficiency and adequacy of the regimes of fiscal policy and payment system measures of the government of the day. However, in Nigeria the reverse is the case, the trio of Federal Ministry of Finance, Central Bank of Nigeria and National Bureau of Statistics, through the regimes have been antagonistic towards each other, as they engage in a battle of supremacy.

It was also noted that occasionally the Economic Adviser to the President and the National Planning Commission also worsen the situation, by equally brandishing figures. Much of what the managers of Nigeria's economy and the President have made out of economic development is merely, to have subjected the economic management sector to high wire politicking as a result of the prevalence of corruption in the system and the volume of money flowing to that sector of government from local and international sources.

Going by the expectation of a federal system of government, the economic adviser is to advice the Head of Government, who will then assemble his economic team composed of his Economic Adviser, Minister of Finance, National Planning Commission (which is already represented, this is because the Chairman of the commission is the President's Economic Adviser), the Central Bank Governor and the head of National Bureau of Statistics. They will then deliberate under the chairmanship of the President. The Federal Ministry of Finance, Central Bank of Nigeria and National Bureau of Statistics will then make presentations. This is with special reference to how the proposal will affect their respective sectors on economic policies and programs, decision will then be taken, and implantation programs designed, executed and enforced where necessary.

With respect to quarterly, bi-annual or annual economic briefings, the Finance Minister, Central Bank Governor, National Bureau of Statistics and the National Planning Commission meet under the chairmanship of the Finance Minister. They will then compare their information about developments in economy within the giving regime, criticize them and then the Finance Minister will make public pronouncement on the economy generally.

For the purpose of coordination and regulation, these bodies have constitutional rights to equally make sector related pronouncements with respect to developments in their respective sectors. This however will only contradict, as we have seen in the country in the past 16 years of democratic rule if government is not delivering. The reality is that in a functional system one will see all of them working as a system and complementing each other in the overall interest of the economy.⁴

These arguments can be assessed or compared with the following statement from official corridors.⁵

When I was Vice President we had to call a meeting of the key actors because we go for one program. The Chief Economic Adviser will give figures about economic indices, Gross Domestic Product, National Growth and Inflation. The Planning Minister will give different figures, the Finance Minister would make presentation and give different figures. The Central Bank of Nigeria Governor would make a presentation and give you different figures. We said, "no we can't be doing this." Even now we have some differences, only yesterday, I was going through some documents and noticed that what I got from Planning Ministry and Finance did not quite agree. So you continue to get such because of circumstances. But in the end they must come to a compromise or do reconciliation and the exact figure will be known. On the speculated subsidy of 2.3 trillion for 2012... He said ... A number of things happened, because of this figure of 2.3 trillion, the Central Bank of Nigeria is supposed to raise alarm for government to react. You cannot continue paying and paying. Assuming there was no probe of fuel subsidy payment, ... the Central Bank of Nigeria would have kept quiet. Then the figures can rise from 500billion naira in 2010 to 10trillion naira in 2012 and you just pay.⁶

By standard practice the attachment (Coordinating) to the ministerial portfolio of the Finance Minister under President Jonathan's administration was wrong. Secondly, the creation of Ministry of National Planning is equally wrong, it will just have the same effect as having the Budget Minister. These developments create friction in government, this is because with the Budget Minister and Planning Minister and the Finance Minister in the same cabinet, the system will not be efficient, because there will be frequent friction in governance. This was evident in the tenure of Alhaji Samsudeen Usman as the Planning Minister, the Central Bank, Finance Ministry and Planning Ministry were in constant friction, leading to stagnation in government and economic development.

For optimal economic performance the Central Bank should be autonomous of any ministry. It should be an appendage of the Presidency, There should be a Ministry of Finance, Budget Office, National Bureau of Statistics, headed by the Statistician General of the Federation and the National Planning Commission, all these bodies should be directly accountable to the President of the country. The heads of all these government bodies should by virtue of their offices be economic advisers to the President, with the Finance Minister as the Chief Economic Adviser to the President and head of the economic management team.

This discussion derives from the utopian assumptions upon which the Central Bank of Nigeria, Ministry of Finance, National Bureau of Statistics and Presidency, had over time based the assessment of economic growth and expansion in Nigeria, such that with the monetization of petrodollar proceeds, they go to town with the political assumptions that the economy had grown and expanded to the proportion of the petrodollar yield.

³ From General Obasanjo's time in 1999 to 2015.

⁴ Izebuwa Osayimwese and Sunday Iyare, The Economics of Nigerian Federalism: Selected Issues in Economic Management published 1991, 21(4),

President Jonathan's tell interview Tell March, February 27 2012. p. 44.

Most worrisome of all, is the bases and assumptions upon which public policy issues such as unemployment and industrialization are based. Former President Obasanjo was quoted to have asked in the course of his administration, if there was a Nigerian who did not have up to \$\frac{\text{N1}00.000.00}{100.000.00}\$ (one hundred thousand naira) in his account. He blamed his predecessors and successors for Nigeria's food insecurity. The main question that would have been of concern to a serious President then would have been the depth of financial inclusion and literacy in Nigeria. President Jonathan was also quoted to have queried the notion of poverty in Nigeria, when the country ranks amongst the countries with largest number of rich men that have their own private jets.

On unemployment, the United States authorities are more proactive in its assessment of employment and unemployment. In the United States the practice is to base unemployment on the population coming for unemployment benefit, such that where there is a weekly decline in recipients, the presumption is that governance has resulted in employment. But where there is an increase in the population, the presumption is that governance has resulted in job loss or unemployment.

In Nigeria there seem to be no standard measure upon which employment and unemployment is determined. The yardstick at the National Planning Commission is different from that of the National Bureau of Statistics, and that of the Central Bank, Ministry of Finance and Budget Office. None of these bodies agrees on the issue, at this point, owing to the sensitive nature of employment and unemployment. We call on economic team to declare a yardstick for determining unemployment in Nigeria.

3. Monetary Policy

These are regimes of methodologies, economic models, guidelines and incentives deployed by the Central Bank of Nigeria to ensure financial stability. Or simply; the methods and incentives deployed to balance the deflationary/inflationary tendencies and its implications on the economy. These tendencies can have debilitating or unhealthy effects on the financial system, which are not in the overall interest of the economy.

For example, the real sector, Small and Medium scale Enterprises which complements and consolidates government fiscal inclinations, as the providers of employment and taxable incomes are almost extinct in Nigeria. This is because, the monetary policy regimes of successive governments in Nigeria have rather made access to credit horrendous through unreasonable interest rate in an economy where the power sector and infrastructure are irrationally unsupportive, morrubond, poor, unproductive, dysfunctional and unpredictable

Monetary policies are a blend of measures and set of instruments designed by the Central Bank to regulate the value, supply and cost of money, at a level that is consistent with the absorptive capacity of the economy without necessarily generating undue pressures on domestic prices and the exchange rate.¹⁰

This development becomes more worrisome when noting the fact that the monetary policy committee of the bank is under the Central Bank Act the key to the constitutional and statutory duties and functions of the bank. The bank failed because it did more in playing politics with the mints department, through denominationalism. However, concentrating on currency quality and denomination as good and important as it is, cannot replace the strength of the currency in the market, and how it can encourage progressive and positive economic activities. Today it is clear to us that in this era of dwindling oil price in the international market, politicizing monetary policy on monthly basis did more harm than good. It was recently an issue of national discuss that the United States government attempted to tamper with their interest rate since the Global Financial Crisis in September 2015. This is coming eight years after the crisis.

3.1. Goals of the Prevailing Monetary Regime

The prevailing monetary policy has been designed to illicit some fundamental outcomes such as; full industrial capacity, progressive and sustainable infrastructural or economic development, complementary human capital development, reasonable level of employment and most crucially a healthy and secured populations.¹¹

With the pressure on foreign exchange, zero export base outside oil, poor refining capacity in an economy that is heavily dependent on import of virtually all domestic products and 70-80% of the petrodollar earned, the economy saw capital flight by corrupt political office holders. Price stability, control of inflation, promotion of sustainable economic growth and developments that would reduce unemployment becomes nothing but illusive. This is because, as inflation assumes irrational dimension, prices become unstable, economic underdevelopment and unemployment assume unprecedented proportion.

Successive regimes that are characterized with large governments from 39 to 42 Ministries, dozens of duplicated agencies, departments and parastatals resulting in irrational public spending, with recurrent expenditure almost tripling capital expenditure. The most worrisome trend is the attitude of fiscal indiscipline, characterized by full implementation of recurrent expenditure and less than 40% implementation ratio for the capital expenditure and persistent regimes of aged or ageing infrastructure that cannot support growth. Poor to zero power supply, double taxation, highways flooded by politicians posing with public revenue documents

⁷ www.nairaland.com/.../obasanjo-blames-Yaradua-Shagari-others-for-Nigeria's-food-insecurity-...

⁸ Ibid.

⁹ dailypost.ng/.../jonathan-administration-ran-nigeria's-economy-aground-APC-...

¹⁰ Olke O. Breaking CBN force monopoly. Newswatch February 20, 2012. p. 40-42.

¹¹ www.doublegist.com/monetary-policy-in-nigeria-the-role-in-promoting-economic-stability-in-nig...

¹² Ibid.

demanding endless papers. What have we to anchor price stability, successive regimes of healthy inflationary trends, development and employment?

Monetary Policy Regulation can be defined as measures aimed at achieving determined or defined goals of governance, which consists of;1. Price stability, 2. control of inflation, 3. promotion of sustainable economic growth and 4. developments that would reduce unemployment.¹³

The first three goals empty into the fourth, (developments that would reduce unemployment). ¹⁴ These developments are; a modernization of existing infrastructure, such as power, roads, drains, water, health, environmental sanitation and education b massive infrastructure development, such as modern power, roads, drains, water, health, environmental sanitation and education amenities, c development oriented cost of doing business, d encouragement of industrialization through the evolution of industrial clusters. e. prioritized technical education, f encouragement of human capital development.

4. Policy Trusts in Nigeria Monetary Federalism

The Monetary Policy of the Central Bank of Nigeria has been directed at price stability which has the effect of

- 1. reducing manufacturing cost,
- 2. raising the real income of the populace and
- 3. enhancing the demand for goods and services that would enable the manufacturing sector to raise productivity and be in profitable business. The attainment of these goals has remained elusive over the years due to the faulty monetary policy plan of the Central Bank of Nigeria. The bank's regulatory policy is based on the monetization of the foreign exchange earned by government.
 - Definition; monetization is the process whereby the Central Bank of Nigeria captures the foreign exchange earned by the government and prints the naira equivalent for distribution among the three ties of government, namely federal, state and local government. This practice confers on the apex bank the monopolist control of the foreign exchange market. This has been blamed for the wrong in the Nigerian economy as well as the pervasive corruption that holds sway in public and private sector.

Boyo a Lagos based economist and industrialist said that; 16

The product of the CBN's foreign exchange monopoly is the poison in the economy and is the causative factor of the high interest rate, high product cost, unproductive local product, high cost of fuel, contracting industrial space, rising unemployment, insecurity and increasing national debt.

He said further that

the CBN monopoly leads to a tsunami, with a situation where excess money exists simultaneously with a market shortage of credit to the real sector, which is responsible for the depreciation of the naira against the dollar.

Furthermore, the galloping domestic debt level is also a result of Central Bank of Nigeria's liquidity mop up of exercise, caused by its monthly tsunami, (petrodollar monetization). After this the apex Bank through the monetary policy ritual imposes high interest rates which at the end leads to 1.crippling industrial enterprise, 2.increased production cost and 3. Resulting in a market laden with uncompetitive made in Nigeria goods.¹⁷

The real issue is that this obsolete payment system has boxed our economy into a framework that ensures that our people become poorer, despite increasing dollar revenue such that in 2007-2008 Nigeria was coming amongst the world's poorest nations at a time we generated our best ever dollar reserve of 60billion United States Dollar (debt free) and an excess crude account near 34billion United States dollars.¹⁸

This development has somersaulted in undiversified foreign exchange sources, with the after math that low quality best packaged foreign household and pharmaceutical products sell far cheaper than their high quality locally produced counterparts. The framework that accommodates Central Bank of Nigeria's monopoly of the foreign exchange market has seriously damaged our economy over the last 30 years.

There is a positive relationship between the money supply and the prices of goods and services in a situation where quantity of money increases while the output of goods and services remain constant. Too much money will be chasing few goods and that is inflation arising from the monetization policy. Both institutional factors and rigidity have not allowed low lending rates to prevail.¹⁹

The most worrisome of these regulatory blunders habitually committed by both the Central Bank of Nigeria and the Ministry of Finance is the equation of economic growth and employment on the outcome of the expansion in volume of money after the petrodollar monetization. Only to commence the mop up of the excess unplanned floating surplus in an un-proactive exchange rate

¹³ Ibid.,

¹⁴ Note that; we limited it to the reduction of unemployment because, it is when unemployment is reduced that we can talk of the degrees, skills and human resources' utilization, in the employment compared to the assertion of unemployment and secondly, the quality of employment and job satisfaction.

¹⁵ Henry Olufumi Boyo. Endemic Corruption: The Place of Good Governance in a Town Hall meeting of Save Nigeria Group.

¹⁶ Obadiah Malifa ailafia Ex Deputy Governor Central Bank of Nigeria, on monetization of excess crude oil receipts and distribution. Available on www.cenbank.org/.../ARP-2007-....

¹⁷ www.cenbank.org/.../part-two-economic-report-1-cbn...

¹⁸ Ibid

¹⁹ Ibid

regime. This results in bloated/expanded imports, dumping of cheap and poor foreign products, and increased liability on the apex bank arising from policy round tripping, one of which is the servicing of treasury bills and domestic borrowing to ease economic pressures.

The remote effect of these destructive trends is the reeling out of stimulus/bailout on the bleeding industrial sector, even when the bleeding is a product of policy round tripping. The sectors that have benefited from the bailout regimes are i. the textile sector, ii. Banking sector, iii. Aviation, iv. Agric sector to mention a few. One wonders what good these stimulus/bailout regimes have done for our economy. Is the textile sector working? Do we have a supportive banking sector? Is our aviation/air space safe? Are we near self-sufficiency in food production? Remember that for rice and wheat alone billions in foreign exchange is frittered away quarterly in imports, still contributing to monetary regime pressures.

In Nigeria, financial stability is a function of, or is guaranteed by, 1. Price stability, 2.Fiscal policy, 3.Debt management, and 4.Exchange rate policies. However undisciplined fiscal behavior for example generates inflation and neutralizes any monetary policy gain.²⁰

The four fundamentals above can only be stabilized by strict adherence to the tenets of true fiscal federalism, the undoing is the structuring of our fiscal federalism into appropriation, and the supplementary, stimulus/bailout, international aids, donations/grants, Central Bank backed bailout/stimulus, funding under the auspices of Central Bank statutory duties.

One abandoned monetary policy proposal worth revisiting is the unsuccessful redenomination and multi-currency policy. This is because, had State Governments, Local Governments, Ministries, Departments, Agencies of government and individual been allowed to hold major world currencies such as the United States Dollar, British Pound Sterlings, Euro, and Japanese Yenas a medium of exchange as is the case in United Arab Emirate and Liberia to mention a few, the Central Bank of Nigeria would have spent more time in core monetary policy issues rather than frittering its regulatory energy in the wild goose chase of controlling the dollar, euro and pounds. After all these currencies freely exchange hands around the major cities in Nigeria such as Lagos (Marina/Broad Street, Yaba, Ikeja for example), Onitsha (Main Market), Abuja (Wuse Market), Portharcourt, Benin, Kano to mention a few. If they can be bought or changed to naira, why the hue and cry against multiple currency.

5. Fiscal Monetarisim and Food Production

Countries all over the world take food production seriously. This is because they consider it as fundamental to feed their people well, mainly to curtail health emergency and enhance productivity. In Nigeria the reverse is the case, policies on food production are irrationally politicized.

The claim ...by the Central Bank of Nigeria, that the sum of \$\frac{\textbf{N}}{4}151\$ billion has been disbursed to about 200 beneficiaries across the country is raising eye-brows. Agricultural and economic experts say they lack the relevant information to back up or to accord it total belief. The Central Bank of Nigeria had instituted a 200 billion commercial agricultural credit scheme fund in 2009 to improve agriculture and food production in Nigeria. It carries an interest rate not exceeding 9% with a maturity date of not more than seven years. The Central Bank of Nigeria Governor said that The Central Bank of Nigeria Govern

by February, 2011, the Central Bank of Nigeria disbursed the sum of \$\frac{\text{N}}{101.36}\$ billion to finance 109 private sector projects. While 19 state governments had received \$\frac{\text{N}}{1}\$ billion for disbursement to farmers-cooperatives and unions in their constituencies. \$^{24}\$

The only credit that went with the policy implementation was the corrupt, fraudulent, politicized, partisan and criminal implementation procedure, the money was rooted through various State Governments and various Commercial Banks, because individual do not deal with the Central Bank. Available records show that

no Small Medium Enterprise based farm got the incentive. ... United Bank of Africa ¥38.4 billion in 34 agricultural projects First Bank ¥16.2 billion in 48 Agric projects, Zenith ¥15.5 billion. Union Bank ¥12.30 billion. Contrary to which by June 2010 the Federal Ministry of Agriculture reported that 215 commercial farming enterprises applied for loan, 106 were recommended as viable while nine projects were approved to access the fund. 25

According to reports the guide lines were either too stringent or skewed to favour few.²⁶ It restricts the beneficiaries to large scale farmers or agro-based enterprises with asset of not less than \(\frac{1}{2}\)350 million excluding land.²⁷The granting banks are to apply stringent feasibility too. The state government was expected to guarantee loan to farmers domiciled in their state.²⁸ The loop hole in the design of the program is that the number of farmers in that category are not more than 200, so others may just have hastily registered, hired equipment raising fears of internal round tripping in the sector.²⁹ Segun Dastolu³⁰ said that

²⁰ Ibi

²¹ Izuchukwu, The Impact of Fiscal Policy on Agricultural Development in Nigeria. Available on http://www.academia.edu/.../The-impact-of-fiscal-

²² Ibid

²³

²⁴ Ibid

²⁵ Oriloge C. Controversy Trades Agric funds. The News 19th March, 2012. p. 22-23.

²⁷ Ibid

²⁸ Ibid

²⁹ Ibid

... Federal Government actually released the money (1Billion Naira) on April 6th 2011. Ogun State Government received the cheque September 2011. The cheque was domiciled in United Bank of Africa. While Central Bank Nigeria wrote to inform All Famers Association of Nigeria on 16th June 2011. Ogun State Farmers had made a down payment of 10% equity. More so, there was a disagreement on who should underwrite risk in the Agricultural sector since Nigerian Agricultural Insurance Corporation the official underwriter was in disagreement with National Insurance Corporation of Nigeria.³¹

What the foregoing implies is that over the years Federal and State Ministries of Agriculture, Central Bank of Nigeria, State and Local Government had made food production and industrialization, instrument party politics instead of merit driven national agenda, when the existing framework is against monopoly. This calls for a national emergency on food production and industrialization

In using the allusion partisan and political, we will justify our position by looking at incentives to party sponsors and stalwarts. For example, the Aviation Stimulus to Jimoh Ibrahim under Obasanjo Administration after the sale of Air Nigeria to him, with the attendant failure to stimulate Air Nigeria. The outcome was characterized in a. Leasing of the then Air Nigeria Hanger to Arik Airline? There was also the immediate sale of all properties belonging to Air Nigeria across the country and overseas. When we say properties, it should be noted that aside other jurisdictions Air Nigeria owns if not almost all of Ikeja G.R.A. It also has other choice properties in Lagos Abuja and oversea. Minus Global Fleet with its diminishing influence in petroleum marketing in Nigeria, the incentive to Jimoh Ibrahim is more visible in Ghana, Trinidad and Tobago. Will this be described as an act of patriotism?

Aliko Dangote benefited from both Jonathan and Obasanjo, regimes of incentives which seem to be more favorable to Nigerian economy. For example, under the backward integration policy of the then President Obasanjo administration, criteria were set which includes; (a) ban of bagged cement. (b) License for bulk cement only, with condition precedents namely i. the interested company must own a bagging plant, and ii. He must own a regular cement factory. Aliko Dangote established a cement bagging plant and acquired Benue Cement by which he reached the policy threshold.

Under President Jonathan Aliko Dangote was also given petroleum refining license and one-billion-naira incentive to venture into commercial rice production. The later incentive also stabilized the country's economy as former.

It should be noted that in line with President Obasanjo policy of backward integration, Aliko Dangote also announced a policy of backward integration.³² However the dividend of his own corporate policy should transcend cement, sac or bagging, pastas and associated processed foods and sugar. He should be as visible in rice production as he is in cement. This will divorce his own backward integration policy from the conspiracy theory that went with the frustration of Ibeto Group.³³ Once he clears the air the burden will shift to Ibeto Group a company that has south east origin, a region that is so much into importation business with minimal interest in production.

With this trend, we now have private companies that have replaced the then monopolist public corporation, with the government just coming up with a specific policy on the Draft Competition and Consumer Protection Policy of 2014 whose implementation seems elusive.³⁴

The federal government is taking steps to tackle unfair business practices and provide a fair and competitive environment for industry, trade and investment. In this regard, a new competition and consumer Protection Policy designed to address the various trade concerns and provide a level playing ground for business in the interest of consumers ... the minister of industry, Trade and Investment Olusegun Aganga, who made this known in Abuja yesterday, said that the new policy would forestall the emergence of private monopolies, cartels as well endanger fair-trade and ensure consumer have value for their money³⁵

This is coming at the heels of monopolies in sensitive sector which is creation of government. What then is the difference or rational criteria for frustrating Otumba Adenuga Jr. in the first licensing of GSM operators in Nigeria only to later allow Etisalat? Why give preference to MTN a South African company when there were interests from a Nigerian company?

6. Financial Inclusion and Fiscal Monetarism in Nigeria

Financial Inclusion deals essentially with the percentage of bankable public that have access to banking service in Nigeria. It may also extend to the regulatory framework governing the delivery of informal banking services. With the acquisition of and nationalization of three banks by the Asset Management Corporation of Nigeria we looked forward to regulatory bodies³⁶that will show the way as is the practice all over the world. This is because, with overriding power and means the best manpower and recourses will be available to use the medium to redefine the banking landscape. Today the regulatory agencies had to hurriedly sell, because they had no exemplary financial service delivery methodology to showcase.

The Central Bank of Nigeria believes that without a high level of financial inclusion, there cannot be a meaningful level of economic development. Many Nigerians do not have access to doing business with financial institutions not to talk of accessing bank credit. This is due to very high level of financial illiteracy and the absence of a consolidated credit awareness system.³⁷

```
^{30}The Ogun State Chairman of All Farmers Association of Nigeria
```

³¹ Orilade C. op. cit. p. 30-31

³³ 34

³⁵ Ebulu S. Federal Government to Check Unfair Business Practices, Monoplies. The Nation Friday, July 18, 2014, pg. 53.

³⁶Management Corporation of Nigeria, Nigerian Deposit Insurance Corporation and the Central Bank of Nigeria

³⁷ Ibid

The foregoing is largely a function of poor regulation, no country allows its financial system to degenerate before regulatory measures are taken, about the domination of its informal banking/ financial services by voodoo service providers.

According to Central Bank of Nigeria³⁸

46.3% of the nation's population is financially excluded, while South Africa, Kenya and Botswana have 26%, 32.7% and 33 percent financial exclusion respectively. The situation would have been worse for Nigeria but for those in the informal sectors that exchange in various forms of savings like Esusu and Ajo³⁹ (both of them daily, weekly or monthly contributions) and money lending. These contributed to bringing the total financial access to 53.8 percent in 2006 and 46.3 percent in 2010 according to a report. The informal sector accounted for 17 percent.⁴⁰

The 2011 microfinance development strategy publication defines financial inclusion as

the state of a financial system where members of the society have access to appropriate financial products and services for effective and efficient management of their resources, get needed resources to financial their business and have the financial courage to take up financial opportunities that will lead to increase in their incomes. Simply put financial inclusion means access to finance at reasonable cost to a wide range of financial services. These include savings, short and long term credit leasing and factoring, insurance, pensions, payments, local money transfers and other international remittance.

Today in the informal sector, deregulation to a large extent has created mistrust, trial by ordeal, and disappointments that have discouraged practitioners and customers', alike. What is needed is the design enforcement and awareness of liberal frameworks that will ensure compliance, contractual limits, enforcement of contract and more liberal registration of practitioners. The role of practitioners in expanding financial literacy and encouragement, becomes necessary because the Money Lenders Act itself which is the current framework is obsolete.

The United States Financial Literacy and Education Commission, a public resource created to promote financial education and literacy of American masses, defines Financial Literacy as the ability to awake informed judgments and to take effective actions regarding the current and future use and management of money.⁴³

Financially literate consumers help to re-enforce competitive pressures on financial institutions to order more appropriately priced and transparent services. That is, they help improve the efficiency and quality of financial services. ⁴⁴Given the benefits derivable from a high level of financial inclusion, the Central Bank, with the support of other stakeholders and Credit Awareness Nigeria in 2007, embarked on a nationwide campaign to increase the level of financial inclusion and financial literacy in Nigeria. ⁴⁵

The greatest regulatory blunders habitually visited on us by the managers of our monetary federalism is the politicization of our financial literacy policies. ⁴⁶Today one wonders if commercial banks are paying interest on savings deposit or pay any reasonable percentage as interest on fixed deposit? Yet they charge mind bogging interest on loans and overdrafts and make irrational deductions on transactions, yet the banks' customers remain adamant or are ignorant due to poor financial awareness, yet we are told of campaigns and awareness programs. ⁴⁷

Mr. Ladi Smith, ⁴⁸ in an interview with Daniel Obi said ⁴⁹the broad objectives of the credit awareness campaign are to 1. Enhance financial intermediation and 2. Deepen financial awareness 3.Broaden inclusion to attract and 4. Improve access to demand-oriented financial development services. The other objectives are enhancing better cooperation and collaboration among the stakeholders including, 1.Financial institutions, 2.Regulatory agencies, 3.Developmentpartners and government, 4. Supporting better regulation and 5. Coordination of microfinance institutions, 6. improving the capacity to use loans effectively for income generation 7. Responsible financial behavior and practices among micro and small enterprises 8. Increasing the current level of financial literacy in Nigeria, 9. Creating a situation where at least 80 percent of the population has access to formal financial services, 10. Accelerating economic growth and 11. Reducing poverty by increasing access to finance and 12. Creating a better relationship between borrowers and financial constitutions. Five years after, the country is yet to witness the promised 80 percent financial inclusion just as poverty level has increased in Nigeria. According to the National Bureau of statistics, 60.9% estimated of the 163million population are poor despite 7.6 percent growth in gross domestic product(GDP). The percentage of Nigerians living at abject poverty, that is those who can't afford only a mere essential such as food, shelter and clothing rose to 60.9% in 2010 against 54.7 in 2004.A survey conducted by a body (Enhancing Financial Innovation and Access) has further exposed the level of backwardness in the nation's financial inclusion

³⁸ Http://www.cenbank.org/devfin/fininc/.../financial-inclusion...

³⁹Thrift contributions

 $^{^{40}}$ Ibid

⁴¹ Ibid

⁴² Ibid

⁴³ Community-wealth.org/.../us-financial-literacy-and-education-commission...

⁴⁴ Ibid

 $^{^{45}\} business day on line.com/.../cbns-baseline-survey-on-Nigerias-financial-literacy-inclusion...$

⁴⁶ Esther Ogenyi. CBN Takes Financial Literacy Awareness-to-secondary-schools... Daily Post of March 13, 2015. Available online at dailypost.ng/.../cbn-takes-financial-literacy-awareness-to...

⁴⁷ Like Credit Awareness Nigeria.

⁴⁸Executive Director Credit Awareness Nigeria.

⁴⁹ Ladi Smith. Nigeria: Data on Borrowers now critical to lenders at ibankingondemand.com/.../Nigeria-data-on-borrower-...

drive. The study by Enhancing Financial Innovation and Access in 2010 showed a marginal increase from 35% in 2005 to 36.3% Nigerians as the percentage served by the formal financial market.⁵⁰

Concerning access to financial services information in Nigeria the report said that;

By 2010, 69.9% adult population had heard and understood what loan means, while 59.5% had heard and understood what savings account mean. Only 30% of adult population have bank accounts i.e. approximate 25.4billion people. Also 67.2% of the adult population had previously banked. 65.3% never heard of mortgages. 44.7% never heard of microfinance; 42.8% had never heard of insurance, 38.1% had never heard of ATM. 63% Adult male 76% Adult female, 78.8 percent of rural population are unbanked. The reason being unsteady income, unemployment and distance to bank branch. Mallam Sanusi Lamido said that the ratio of bank branch to the total population is at 24,224 people per branch, then in 2011 when we had 24 deposit money banks with 5,789 branches and 816 microfinance bank with 5,789 branches.⁵¹

So with lesser number of deposit money banks and branches and also microfinance banks, the projection is that we now have more exclusion away from the percentage before the Sanusi Lamido led reform. So the big question will be what percentage of the population live at irrational distance to the nearest bank branch. This is because both the employed and unemployed percentage of the population have loved ones or friends who send them money occasionally.

7. Data Management under Our Monetary Federalism

One huge national embarrassment is the general perception of data in commanding heights of our policy development and management circle notably the Central Bank, Ministry of Finance and the National Office of Statistics. ⁵² Irrespective of efforts in the course of President Obasanjo's Administration the tune has continued to be discordant. ⁵³ According to Dr. Goodluck Ebele Jonathan, ⁵⁴ When I was Vice President we had to call meeting of the key actors because we go for one program, the Chief Economic Adviser will give figures about economic indices Gross Domestic Product, National Growth, Inflation. The Planning Minister will give different figures the Finance Minister would make presentation and give different figures. The Central Bank governor would make a presentation and give you different figures. We said no we can't be doing this. Even now we have some differences. Only yesterday; I was going through some documents and noticed that what I got from Planning Ministry and Finance did not quite agree. (So you continue to get such because of circumstances. But in the end, they must come to a compromise or do reconciliation and the exact figure will be known. On the speculated subsidy of 2.3 trillion for 2012, he said ... A number of things happened, because this figure of 2.3 trillion (the CBN is supposed to raise an alarm for the government to react. You cannot continue paying and paying. Assuming there are no probes of fuel subsidy payment, . . . will the CBN keep quiet? Then the figures can rise from 500billion in 2010 to 10trillion 2012 and you just pay. ⁵⁵

The foregoing remained the case through Jonathan's Administration. This carelessness goes to show the concern of these men and women about the welfare of Nigerians. We hope that President Buhari led Administration will devise proper use and declaration of data that will enhance national development and coordination.

8. Auditing and Monetary Federalism

Governments all over the world take corruption seriously. In governance the key to effective check on corruption is the office of the Auditor General. In advanced democracy the office of the Auditor General is of priority, for example in the United States, Democracy departments like Defense that spend big amounts have Inspector General instead of Auditor General, and the office of Inspector General is so strong and powerful by design to elude enteritis from the Defense Secretary. More so it has the attention of Presidency and Congress at its beck and call.

The reverse is the case in Nigeria, where the Auditor General is appointed by the President who has some powerful politicians that are more powerful that the Auditor General. The effect is that the Auditor General's powers to handle audit queries are treated with levity. Across Ministries Department and Agencies, it was revealed that billions went down the drain. The Auditor General traced 1.complicity, 2.negligence of duty and 3.conspiracy to circumvent laid down rules in contravention of civil service rules, financial regulations and due process regulation/procedure in spending government funds through contract awards.⁵⁶ It is noted that in the usual Nigerian way names of persons and companies used as the conduct pipe for the massive fraud was not there. Okonjo Iwuala told the committee that all-monies made from crude oil through Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation, were not paid into the Federation Account. She said that the money from the oil subsidy was withdrawn before it got to Federation Account.⁵⁷The Nigerian Custom Service accused the Ministry of Finance of aiding Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation not to have documents to back fuel/importation into the country. It stated that Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation does not make any documentation to the

⁵⁰ Ibid

⁵¹ Ibid

⁵² Problems of Monetary and Fiscal Policies in Nigeria, www.doublegist.com/problems-monetary...

⁵³ Sanusi v NNPC: If only Ribadu's Committee Report was not messed up. Available on pointblanknews.com/.../sanusi-vs-nnpc-if...

⁵⁴ President Jonathan's interview with Tell, February 27, 2012, p. 44. Available on https://www.tell.ng/

⁵⁵ Ibid

⁵⁶ Tobes A. Fraud Unlimited Newswatch Feb. 13, 2012.

⁵⁷Joshua Olufemi and Richard Akinwumi, www.premiumtimesng.com/.../investigation-at-least-N11.56trillionexcesscrude-fund-unaccounted-for-in-8-years

customs. Several meetings were held where Nigerian Custom Service was directed not to ask for documents.⁵⁸ The Ministry of Finance wrote to Nigerian Custom Service warning them not to ask for documents because this will cause crisis.⁵⁹

Chief Femi Falana in the same report said that an average of 6.6million United States dollars per month for demurrage on imported products between 2007-2009 . . . which Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation collected was not less than 59% of the total subsidy fund of N4trillion while 41 percent was paid to other marketers from 2006-2009. Variations between Nigerian National Petroleum Corporation claims and Petroleum Pump Pricing Regulatory Agency led to over deductions of several billions. In 2007-2008 and 2009 coming to over 35billion naira he said.

President Mohammed Buhari in the second month of his administration (July 2015) directed that all outstanding Audit queries must be answered it was in realization that throughout Jonathan's Administration Audit Queries were not answered that the President gave further directive that audit queries should be answered within 24 hours. This is a step in the right direction in the most crucial war against corruption and the alignment of the government to the tenets of international standards for political governance.

9. Monetary Federalism and Revenue Allocation in Nigeria

In the discourse of monetary or fiscal federalism in Nigeria, the greatest mistake remains *section 162 of The Constitution* of the Federal Republic of Nigeria. Despite the prefix federal the section remains nothing but Unitary. The unitary inclinations are, a centralization of revenue b. centralization of the management of revenue, c. over concentration of revenue in the Federal Government, handing over Local Government revenues to states. It has remained resistant to resolution despite determined efforts of various administrations and governments.⁶⁴

Muazu Babangida Aliyu⁶⁵said that;

It is an unfair situation where a state like Niger got between 4.2billion to 4.5billion as monthly allocation while some other states in the South-South geopolitical zone received 20 times the amount based on the 15% derivation. ⁶⁶The formula dates back to 1999 with FG getting 52.68%, States, 26.72% L.C 20.6% and derivation 15% of seventy-eight percent of exploration, in offshore areas about 200 miles below the sea. The northern states analyzed the capital allocation in the Fiscal year 2012...and found that 116.5billion naira went to South-South alone while the rest got between 40.8billion-65.5billion, outside of derivation. Other votes to the South-South Zone are 69 billion naira virement for special project in the South-South plus the Niger Delta Development Cooperation budget. ⁶⁸ Experts argue that,

The governments non-judicial use of oil subsidy gains is hunting the government. For instance, from less than one Naira from 1960 to 97 Naira by 2012, it is clear that Ibrahim Babangida increased it 5 times Obasanjo 4times, Abacha 3 times and Yar'Adua once. 69

This development has not only destroyed the federating units but enhanced underdevelopment as the core fiscal principles have been relegated to the background. Remote effect of this development is that after 16 years of sustained democratic governance, the three tears of government have been overfed by the potent unitary forces inherent in the 1999 Constitution as amended.

The issue today is that the federating units are caught up in the battle between the drivers of skill, research and technology in the Oil industry and highly endowed Oil Sheikhs. So the federation is engrossed in high wire politics which no longer dwells on regimes of unrest in the Middle East, but the supremacy battle between technology, research development, human capital on one side (the developed West) and Natural resources endowment, wasteful spending and zero contingency plan on the other side (the Arab League/Oil Producing nations).

The issue now in the international arena is not endowment but policy and pride. And this politicking is also contending with the fact that the number of countries that now have discovered oil have doubled and most of them were our former customers. America is said to be aiming at being the leading exporter of not just crude but petroleum products. Remember that America was in the past one of our leading customer. Ghana too, our former customer, has also discovered oil.

10. Expenditures, Appropriations and Surchages in Nigerian Monetary Federalism

With the instrumentalization of corruption as the tool and core value of public policy in Nigeria, the worst victim is the expenditure system which is through appropriation. The appropriation system in Nigeria is characterized by double expenditure, where, in a fiscal year Ministries, Department and Agencies of government that generate income spend the generated income on what is already taken care of in the budget, and divert the appropriated funds to the pockets of key ministry staff, notably directors.

⁵⁸Ibid.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ NNPC Audit Report Exposes Double Subsidy Payments on Kerosene, Petrol – saharareporters.com/.../nnpc-audit-report

⁶¹ Id.,

⁶² Id., according to the then Auditor General, Mr. Ukwura.

⁶³ Ikeji, C.C. The Politics of Revenue Allocation in Nigeria www.sachajournals.com/.../ikejisjpss002

⁶⁵Governor Niger State, at the inauguration of the Advisory Council of Sir Ahmed Bello Memorial Foundation at Abuja

⁶⁷Chuks Okocha Northern Govs Demand more share of Revenue. www.thisdaylive.com/.../

⁶⁸ Ibid

 $^{^{69}}$ Lucas M. The Past Hunts Government. Tell Magazine October 24, 2011p. 32-33.

For allegedly displaying a lackadaisical attitude to the preparation of their budget proposals for the New Year, members of the House of Representative yesterday lambasted the Central Bank of Nigeria and the Nigerian National Petroleum Cooperation. The Lawmakers said they would stop further deliberations on the 2011Budget until the two parastatal showed enough seriousness. ... There are complaints from the office of the Director General Budget Office against the Nigerian National Petroleum Cooperation for its unwillingness to comply with the Fiscal Responsibility Act. He equally blamed the Central Bank of Nigeria for what he called its "fire brigade approach" to the request which eventually made the apex bank to present a single-page budget to the House a few days ago. Nafada further lamented that if the Central Bank of Nigeria could invest over \tilde{1} 1 trillion in Asset Management Cooperation of Nigeria in 2010 alone, the House could not accept such "skeletal script" as the budget from it.

Secondly Ministries, Department and Agencies of government, continue to repeat expenditure that had been taken care of in the previous year. For example, the Department of Petroleum Resources within 2010-2011 repeated requests in a previous appropriation for the furnishing of the same office. The issue was not the accountability that goes with budgeting, but the fraudulent re-budgeting. This criminality went without punishment encouraging further corruption and impunity.

It was revealed that Ministries, Department and Agencies of government that generated revenue were in the persistent habit of surcharging.

Bright Okogwu the Director General Budget Office revealed that,

On Inspection, Departments that made 85billion naira spent 83.285billion naira. Another made 1.785billion naira and spent 185billion naira. He said that this is despite the fact that the President had directed that revenue generating agencies must remit 25% of their revenue and base their budget on 75%. 71

The assertion that corruption is the instrument of public policy in Nigeria is manifest in, disrespect for laws, guidelines, policies by public officers which result in dualized appropriation, surcharges, repeated appropriation, under implementation, over-estimation to mention a few.

11. Conclusion

With the coming of President Buhari, monetary policy is wearing a new outlook, the administrations core values can be chronicled in anti-corruption, proper audit practices, treasury single account policy, audit of the national petroleum corporation.

Recently with the dwindling oil revenue President Buhari is currently looking at areas like Customs, Federal Inland Revenue Service, and Ports Authority. These are departments of government upon which true fiscal federalism is founded.

From the foregoing it appears that the outlook our monetary and fiscal systems are undergoing systemic reforms that will guarantee true federalism and that fiscal federalism will dominate the administrations fiscal drive.

The central development bedeviling our fiscal federalism is oil. The dwindling revenue from oil appears to be a blessing in disguise, as we have started discovering other areas of revenue. Should the current reforms be allowed to go full circle, we may be home with near classical fiscal policy and close to joining the league of developing nations going by the dividend true fiscal federalism will bring to bear in our political landscape.

12. References

- i. www.doublegist.com>problems-of-monetary-and-fiscal-policies-in-nigeria
- ii. Wikipedia.wiki.Federalism_in_Nigeria
- iii. From General Obasanjo's time in 1999 to 2015.
- iv. Izebuwa Osayimwese and Sunday Iyare, The Economics of Nigerian Federalism: Selected Issues in Economic Management published 1991, 21(4), pp. 89-101
- v. President Jonathan's tell interview Tell March, February 27 2012. p. 44.
- vi. Ibid
- vii. www.nairaland.com/.../obasanjo-blames-Yaradua-Shagari-others-for-Nigeria's-food-insecurity-...
- viii. Ibid.
- ix. dailypost.ng/.../jonathan-administration-ran-nigeria's-economy-aground-APC-...
- x. Olke O. Breaking CBN force monopoly. Newswatch February 20, 2012. p. 40-42.
- xi. www.doublegist.com/monetary-policy-in-nigeria-the-role-in-promoting-economic-stability-in-nig...
- xii. Ibid.
- xiii. Ibid.,
- xiv. Note that; we limited it to the reduction of unemployment because, it is when unemployment is reduced that we can talk of the degrees, skills and human resources' utilization, in the employment compared to the assertion of unemployment and secondly, the quality of employment and job satisfaction.
- xv. Henry Olufumi Boyo. Endemic Corruption: The Place of Good Governance in a Town Hall meeting of Save Nigeria Group.
- xvi. Obadiah Malifa ailafia Ex Deputy Governor Central Bank of Nigeria, on monetization of excess crude oil receipts and distribution. Available on www.cenbank.org/.../ARP-2007-....

⁷⁰Toba J Reps threaten to stop 2011 Budget over cbn, nnpc. Nigerian Compass, Friday March 4, 2011 pg. FP- pg. 53.

⁷¹ Lucas M. How Revenue Agencies Surcharges Government. Tell Magazine February 13 2011 p36-40.

- xvii. www.cenbank.org/.../part-two-economic-report-1-cbn...
- xviii. Ibid
- xix. Ibid
- xx. Ibid
- xxi. Izuchukwu, The Impact of Fiscal Policy on Agricultural Development in Nigeria. Available on http://www.academia.edu/.../The-impact-of-fiscal-...
- xxii. Ibid
- xxiii. Ibid
- xxiv. Oriloge C. Controversy Trades Agric funds. The News 19th March, 2012. p. 22-23.
- xxv. Ibid
- xxvi. Ibid
- xxvii. Ibid
- xxviii. The Ogun State Chairman of All Farmers Association of Nigeria
- xxix. Orilade C. op. cit. p. 30-31
- xxx. Ebulu S. Federal Government to Check Unfair Business Practices, Monoplies. The Nation Friday, July 18, 2014, pg. 53.
- xxxi. Management Corporation of Nigeria, Nigerian Deposit Insurance Corporation and the Central Bank of Nigeria
- xxxii. Ibid
- xxxiii. Http://www.cenbank.org/devfin/fininc/.../financial-inclusion...
- xxxiv. Thrift contributions
- xxxv. Ibid
- xxxvi. Ibid
- xxxvii. Ibid
- xxxviii. Community-wealth.org/.../us-financial-literacy-and-education-commission...
- xxxix. Ibid
 - xl. businessdayonline.com/.../cbns-baseline-survey-on-Nigerias-financial-literacy-inclusion...
 - xli. Esther Ogenyi. CBN Takes Financial Literacy Awareness-to-secondary-schools... Daily Post of March 13, 2015. Available online at dailypost.ng/.../cbn-takes-financial-literacy-awareness-to...
 - xlii. Like Credit Awareness Nigeria.
- xliii. Executive Director Credit Awareness Nigeria.
- xliv. Ladi Smith. Nigeria: Data on Borrowers now critical to lenders at ibankingondemand.com/.../Nigeria-data-on-borrower-...
- xlv. Ibid
- xlvi. Ibid
- xlvii. Problems of Monetary and Fiscal Policies in Nigeria, www.doublegist.com/problems-monetary...
- xlviii. Sanusi v NNPC: If only Ribadu's Committee Report was not messed up. Available on pointblanknews.com/.../sanusi-vs-nnpc-if...
- xlix. President Jonathan's interview with Tell, February 27, 2012, p. 44. Available on https://www.tell.ng/
 - 1. Ibid
 - li. Tobes A. Fraud Unlimited Newswatch Feb. 13, 2012.
 - lii. Joshua Olufemi and Richard Akinwumi, www.premiumtimesng.com/.../investigation-at-least-N11.56trillionexcesscrude-fund-unaccounted-for-in-8-years
- liii. Ibid.
- liv. Ibid.
- lv. NNPC Audit Report Exposes Double Subsidy Payments on Kerosene, Petrol saharareporters.com/.../nnpc-audit-report
- lvi. Id.,
- lvii. Id., according to the then Auditor General, Mr. Ukwura.
- lviii. Ikeji, C.C. The Politics of Revenue Allocation in Nigeria www.sachajournals.com/.../ikejisjpss002
- lix. Governor Niger State, at the inauguration of the Advisory Council of Sir Ahmed Bello Memorial Foundation at Abuja
- lx. Id.,
- lxi. Chuks Okocha Northern Govs Demand more share of Revenue. www.thisdaylive.com/.../
- lxii. Ibid
- lxiii. Lucas M. The Past Hunts Government. Tell Magazine October 24, 2011p. 32-33.
- lxiv. Toba J Reps threaten to stop 2011 Budget over cbn, nnpc. Nigerian Compass, Friday March 4, 2011 pg. FP- pg. 53.
- lxv. Lucas M. How Revenue Agencies Surcharges Government. Tell Magazine February 13 2011 p36-40.