

THE INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF BUSINESS & MANAGEMENT

Innovation Patterns of Small to Medium Size Hotels in Harare, Zimbabwe

Nehemiya Ndhlovu

Faculty, Department of Tourism and Hospitality, Limkokwing University of Creative Technology, Botswana

Abstract:

The study sought an in-depth understanding of innovative patterns of small to medium size independent hotels in Harare, Zimbabwe in the management of business. The study adopted a qualitative case study design located in the interpretive research paradigm. A purposive sample was drawn from all managers in the five small to medium size hotels within Harare Central Business District and thirty junior staff members from different departments of the five hotels who had served the longest. Data were collected using semi structured interviews and were analysed for content using thematic analysis. The study found that small to medium size hotels in Harare were moderately innovative and that they focused more on marketing innovations than any other forms of innovation. The study concludes that small to medium size hotels implemented very limited innovation activities particularly in terms of product innovations, process innovations and management innovations. The study recommends that small to medium size hotels should innovate in all areas in order to differentiate their products or services from those of their competitors and so as to outperform their competitors.

Keywords: *Innovation, small to medium size hotels, product innovation, process innovation, management innovation, marketing innovation*

1. Introduction and Background

Business competitiveness and sustainability depends mainly on the effective management of innovation (Dooley & O'sullivan, 2007). In current competitive environments, innovation is generally considered a firm's core value creation capacity and one of its most important competitive weapons (Sandvik & Sandvik, 2003) not only for larger firms, but also for the small and medium sized enterprises (Jong & Vermueulen, 2006). Innovation allows businesses to improve the quality of products, increase efficiency, cut costs, meet the changing needs of customers, increase sales and profits, and gain greater market share and differentiate themselves from competitors (Nicolau & Santa-Maria, 2003). No particular size of a firm can be cited as better suited for innovation (Freel, 2000; and Jong & Vermeulen, 2006). However, little is known on the innovativeness of small to medium size hotels (OECD, 2005; Dadura & Lee, 2011) though it is acknowledged that SMEs have also the potential to innovate (OECD, 2005). Research on capturing the complexity that surrounds tourism and hospitality innovation is still weak (Hjalager, 2010). Due to the lack of research based knowledge, managers often rely on gut feeling, speculation, and their own limited experience about the keys to innovation success (Nicolau & Santa-Maria, 2013).

In Zimbabwe the hotel industry, like any other in Southern Africa is a combination of small, medium and large enterprises. These hotels also range from privately owned, family run and ungraded hotels to international chain luxury hotels (Mkono, 2010). For the graded hotels they are classified into five categories ranging from one star to five stars (Statutory Instrument no.128 of 2005). The one star and the two stars' hotels are referred to as the small to medium size hotels (Statutory Instrument no.128 of 2005). Some of the hotels are government owned (Rusike & Chitambara, 2012). Zimbabwe has the second largest number of hotel rooms in Southern Africa after South Africa (Ruzivo Trust, 2013). While the majority of hotels are concentrated in the major tourist centres of Victoria Falls and Kariba, Harare, the capital city also houses a considerable number of hotels, especially commercial hotels. Harare City, the area of study in this research is well known for the plethora of both individual and internationally recognised hotel brands and little is known on the innovativeness of small to medium size hotels. The study sought to explore the innovative patterns of small to medium size hotels in a dynamic and competitive environment and particularly focuses on small to medium size hotels in Zimbabwe, Harare. Though there are publications related to this, there are still scarce and there are research gaps in relation to the types of innovations implemented by small to medium size hotels in Harare, Zimbabwe.

According to Zimbabwe Tourism Authority (2011), Harare has twelve independent hotel establishments. Some of these hotels closed and some are now operating as night clubs. Only a few are still operating as hotels. Despite the prolific hospitality sector in Harare, there are a number of challenges facing the hotel industry in Zimbabwe. Among these is the need for refurbishments, under investment and socio-political unrests (Ruzivo Trust, 2013). There is also instability in terms of employment due to on-going retrenchments (Rusike & Chitambara, 2012).

Of the five independent hotels in the central business district (CBD), three have no star rating while the other two have a star rating of two. Working towards attaining a star rating of five or less appears to be quite a big challenge for most of them. This makes it difficult for them to compete with the giant chain hotels. For small to medium sizes independent hotels, survival means bracing competition

even amongst themselves. Competition in tourism is driven by a number of factors including pricing, volume, innovation, technology and entrepreneurial management (Christie & Crompton, 2001). However, this study is more concerned with innovation in hotel SMEs, their growth and failure as this is an area that has received anecdotal attention in tourism literature (Thomas, Shaw & Page, 2011). Research in the operations of small to medium size independent hotels is scant. Little is known about innovative patterns of these privately owned hotels in the management of business. Most of the research on hotel innovation tends to focus on large chain corporations though in recent years there has been an increasing awareness and recognition of the importance of small and medium enterprises (SMEs) in extant literature. Therefore, the study sought to explore and understand innovative patterns of the small to medium size hotels in Harare.

2. Literature Review

The SMEs sector is efficient at generation of job opportunities however at a very low cost for some segments of the population. Jobs in the large scale corporations in most countries are showing negative growth, while some jobs in the SMEs sector of the economy are showing positive growth. The contribution of the SMEs sector to the economy is crucial for the achievement of the broader development objectives such as poverty alleviation, spreading of employment opportunities and increasing indigenous ownership of resources in the economy (Chidoko *et al.*, 2011). Small to medium size enterprises are seedbeds for indigenous entrepreneurship as they are responsible for mobilizing ungenerated capacity (Charantimath, 2006), are labour intensive, and contribute to the decentralization of industry (Hutchinson & Quintas 2008) and contribute more to equitable distribution of the national income (Dumbu & Musingafi, 2010). Other economic advantages of small to medium-scale businesses include supplying dynamism (i.e., they contribute to the growth of the economy), contributing to economic competition, raising the level of popular participation in the economy and promoting growth with equity. However, some of these SMEs are faced by a dynamic and competitive environment and the question that still remains unanswered is, how do these SMEs particularly those in the hospitality sector innovate in order to remain competitive and sustainable in developing nations like Zimbabwe. The paper sought to address this gap by exploring the innovation patterns of small to medium size hotels in a dynamic and competitive environment. The study focuses on small to medium size hotels in Zimbabwe, Harare.

3. Types of Innovations

Studies on types of innovations implemented by small to medium size independent hotels are very limited. According to Hjalager (2010), innovations in tourism can be in one or a combination of the following categories:

3.1. Product or Service Innovations

consist of changed or entirely new services or products which are developed to the stage of commercialization, and whose novelty should be evident to either producers, consumers, suppliers or competitors (Hjalager, 2010). Product or service innovations also refer to changes which clients view and consider as new; either in the sense of never seen before, or new to the particular enterprise (Hjalager, 2010). In the accommodation sector, the "Formulae 1" concept introduced by the Accor Hotel chain represents a generic innovation. Hall and Williams (in Hjalager, 2010) state that these hotels were started to provide a low-price service without compromising essential and basic hotel standards such as accessibility, cleanliness, and comfortable beds. Some studies in the hotel sector refer to single qualities of the hotel services as innovative, for example gastronomy, animation, infrastructure, or wellness facilities (Nicolau & Santa-Maria, 2013), customized comfort (Enz & Siguaw, 2006) or environmental measures (Le, Hollenhorst, Harris, McLaughlin & Shook, 2006). Some of the new tourism products developed in recent years are the loyalty programmes, environmentally sustainable accommodation facilities, and events based on local traditions (Hjalager, 2010).

Gunday, Kandah and Ranch (in Nicolau & Santa-Maria, 2013) also note that product innovation is one of the major elements of competitiveness, entrenched in the structure of an organization and its operations. They consider product innovation as one of the fundamental instruments of growth strategies to enter new markets, to increase the existing market share and to provide the company with a competitive edge.

Studies on how small to medium size hotels implement product or service innovations in dynamic and competitive environments have not been found. The study therefore seeks to fill the gap by exploring how small to medium size hotels implement product innovation.

3.2. Process Innovations

Refer typically to backstage initiatives which aim at escalating efficiency, productivity and flow (Hjalager, 2010). They tend to raise the performance of existing operations by means of new or improved technology, or by redesigns of the entire production line as a result of process re-engineering. Process innovations may be platforms for improved services that will be recognizable to the customer and add to the value of the product. An example is automatic check-in systems which can save time for both customers and staff. Recent examples of major process innovations in tourism are computerized management and monitoring systems, robots for cleaning and maintenance, and self-service devices. Drawing from the discussion it can be noted that process innovation is an important type of innovation in the management of innovation. However, very little is known on how small to medium size hotels implement process innovation in a dynamic and competitive environment to create value to the customers. It is therefore important to extend this research too small to medium size hotels in order to determine to see if the same holds true.

3.3. Management Innovations

Consist of new job profiles, collaborative structures, and authority systems often in combination with the introduction of new

products, services and production technologies (Hjalager, 2010). They deal with ways of organizing internal collaboration, directing and empowering staff, building careers and compensating work with pay and benefits (Nicolau & Santa-Maria, 2013). They are intended to increase a firm's performance by reducing administration costs or transaction costs, improving workplace satisfaction, gaining access to non-tradable assets or reducing costs of supplies. Management innovations can result in staff empowerment through job enrichment, decentralization, and training or in deskilling enforced by the (re)introduction of scientific management methods. Managerial innovations can also be aimed at improving workplace satisfaction and nurturing internal knowledge and competence assets (Hall & Williams, 2008; Shaw & Williams, 2009). According to Ottenbacher and Gnoth (in Nicolau and Santa-Maria, 2013) the main challenge for many tourism enterprises is to develop methods to retain staff, maintain flexibility and control costs. In light of the discussion, it can be noted that management innovation is an important type of innovation. However empirical studies on how small to medium size hotels implement management innovations have not been found. Being a very important type of innovation there is need to extend research on small to medium size independent hotels. The study therefore will explore how small to medium size hotels implement management innovation in a dynamic and competitive environment.

3.4. Marketing Innovations

Change the way that overall communication to, and with, customers is undertaken, and how relationships between the service provider and customer are built and withheld (Hankinton, 2004). They focus on serving the needs of the clients with the aim of boosting the sales of the firm. A well-known and early example within the tourism sector is the elaboration and introduction of loyalty programmes, which are now widespread and come in numerous versions (Morais, Dorsch, & Backman, 2004). The programmes basically change the relationships between tourism providers and the customer from a single and simple purchase procedure to an exchange of loyalty and intangible supplements, and transform the interaction to a long-term affair with a bounded and complex rationality. Marketing innovations also consist of the co-production of brands (Hankinton, 2004), an activity which takes place in, for example, gastronomy and tourism. Marketing of wine, for example, often goes hand in hand with marketing of a specific destination (Carlsen, 2006). The question that still remains unanswered is how small to medium size hotels implement marketing innovations in a dynamic and competitive environment.

4. Methodology

The study adopted a qualitative multiple case study design located in the interpretive research paradigm. A purposive sample was drawn from all managers in the five small to medium size hotels within Harare Central Business District and thirty junior staff members from different departments of the five hotels who had served the longest. Data were collected using semi-structured interviews and focus group discussions and were analysed for content using thematic analysis. The themes were the different types of innovations noted by Hjalager (2010). Interview protocols were the main instruments used in collecting data for the study. The codes that were used for the sample are illustrated on table 1 below:

Data collection instrument	Codes
Focus Group Discussions	FGH1, FGH2, FGH3, FGH4, FGH5 (Where FGH1= focus group discussion from participants in hotel 1, FGH2= focus group discussion from participants in hotel 2, FGH3= focus group discussion from participants in hotel 3, FGH4= focus group discussion from participants in hotel 4, FGH5= focus group discussion from participants in hotel 5)
Interviews	M1, M2, M3, M4, M5 (Where M1= manager 1, M2= manager 2, M3= manager 3, M4= manager 4, M5= manager 5) H1, H2, H3, H4, H5 (H1= HOTEL1, H2= hotel2, H3= hotel, H4= hotel4 H5= hotel5)

Table 1: Sample codes

5. Findings

5.1. Theme: Types of Innovations Implemented by Small to Medium Size Hotels in Harare

This section presents and analyses the findings on the types of innovations that were implemented by small to medium size hotels in Harare in the past five years. Table 2 summarizes the issues raised.

Sub-themes	Issues raised
Marketing innovations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Marketed through networking with other organisations Used the social media as a marketing communications tool Segmented the market Competitive pricing Offered personalised services
Product innovations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Increased recreational facilities for example spa and gym. Introduced ethnic cuisine and local traditional cuisine
Process innovations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Computerised based bookings system Connected the internet
Management innovations	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Used computerised management system (CCTV) Managed across areas or departments

Table 2: Innovation types of small to medium size independent hotels in Harare
Source: Field data

5.2. Sub-Theme One: Marketing Innovations

From the data generated the study revealed that small to medium size independent hotels in Harare implemented various marketing strategies. Small to medium size independent hotels in Harare neither had a marketing officer nor a marketing department due to their small size. Marketing was mainly done by the general manager. One of the marketing strategies adopted was networking with other organizations. In an interview of the managers M2 from hotel H3 noted:

- We have got one or two people in government whom we work with and they try and get business for us from the ministries.

Another marketing innovation noted was the use of the social media as a marketing communications tool. Managers indicated that they had moved away from the traditional methods of marketing. They regularly updated their clients through Facebook; WhatsApp; twitter and linked-in. They noted that some customers preferred giving their feedback and comments on service quality through the social media rather than filling in questionnaires. Social media and networking were viewed by the small to medium size independent hotels in Harare as very powerful marketing communications tools in this age of modern technology. Moving away from traditional marketing methods to modern methods was identified as one of the innovations achieved by small to medium size independent hotels in the past five years. Manager M1 from hotel H1 remarked:

- We have also moved away from just traditional marketing to mainly focusing on social media like Facebook page where you talk to people about what's happening in your hotel. You also get feedback from the person who was here last night whom you did not have a chance to meet and chat and in turn you get feedback from him/her on Facebook."

Segmenting the market was another notable marketing innovation by small to medium size independent hotels in Harare. One of the managers M4 from hotel H3 noted:

- We have two types of bars for our hotel. Of the two bars one is referred to as a noisy bar and the other as a quiet bar. The noisy bar attracts middle aged working class group. For the quiet bar it does not have a television and it attracts top government and top corporate executives.

Offering personalized services was another marketing strategy adopted by small to medium size independent hotels in Harare. Small to medium size independent hotels in Harare believed that being small made them have a competitive advantage over their competitors as they offered more personalized services than big hotels. Managers argued that their products and services and work processes were not affected by the strategies of their competitors. They argued that their strength lied in giving their customers that personal touch through providing more personalized services unlike the big chain hotels. One of the managers M3 from hotel H1 remarked:

- Our competitive advantage is that we are small and once people come through here they get more attention than in a big hotel whereby there are so many people. We create a home away from home for our customers. We create an environment, product, process, service that feels like home to our customers. We are also more flexible and responsive to the needs of our customers. Guests are the lifeblood of the business and one must do everything within his power to ensure that they have a pleasant day.

Competitive pricing was another marketing strategy employed by small to medium size independent hotels in promoting products and services. When small to medium size independent hotels set their price they considered the competition around, facilities offered, location and the target market. One of the managers M1 from hotel H1 remarked:

- We focus solely on what the competitors are charging and strive to meet or beat those prices though it's a difficult strategy for small businesses to maintain, because it provides very narrow profit margins that make it challenging for the business to achieve momentum to grow

From the above findings it can be concluded that small to medium size independent hotels in Harare a number of activities in terms of marketing innovations.

5.3. Sub-Theme Two: Product Innovations

The study revealed that in the past five years small to medium size independent hotels in Harare had done fairly well in terms of product innovations. They had made some efforts to enhance their product portfolio through a number of ways. One manager M4 from hotel H4 noted that his hotel had recently got a gym and a recreational area which was a mini spa where there was a hairdresser, manicurist and beauty therapist. His words were:

- We identified some area in the hotel which was not being fully utilised and we decided to utilise it. We renovated some of the rooms to become spa and we changed one of the rooms upstairs to become a gym.

In one of the focus group discussion FGH3, one member noted;

- Our rooms used to be carpeted but now they have since been tiled. Our rooms also used to share toilets but they are now en-suites.

This was also agreed to by other members.

Another development noted was in the area of culinary arts. It was noted that some hotels kept on improving their cuisine making it special and unique for their customers. One manager M2 from hotel H1 noted:

- We have introduced a variety of cuisine such as ethnic cuisine, like the Italian cuisine, East African cuisine and local traditional cuisine, in an effort to spread our market. We also have a special traditional dish and we are quite popular for serving tsuro (rabbit) with our traditional rapoko sadza. We always have repeat business from our loyal customers who enjoy our dish.

This was also supported by FGH1 members who echoed the same statement. From the above findings the study suggested that small to medium size independent hotels in Harare were making great efforts to enhance their product portfolio by carpeting the rooms that were tiled, converting them to en-suites and setting up gyms and recreational areas in their hotels.

5.4. Sub-Theme Three: Process Innovations

The study revealed that small to medium size independent hotels in Harare had made much effort to improve their operations in the past five years. They had improved their operations by shifting away from the manual system of bookings to computer based system. One of the managers M2 from hotel H3 noted:

- Most of the work was done manually and physically and so much work now is computerized. We now have more time managing people and meeting with people as opposed to doing paper work which is now automatically captured in the system when a customer checks in. Everything is managed online.

Another manager, M1 from hotel H2 noted:

- We now have internet, unlike before we could email quotations to our customers and also place our orders online.

From the data generated it could be concluded that small to medium size independent hotels in Harare had done much to improve their delivery processes in the past five years.

5.5. Sub-Theme Four: Management/ Organizational Innovations

The study revealed that small to medium size independent hotels in Harare did not do much in terms of management or organizational innovations. Most of the small to medium size independent hotels had come up with an organizational structure which was completely different from the usual hotel structure shown in Figure 6. It was noted that because of their small size, departments had been merged such that managers managed across departments. One of the managers M2 from hotel H1 noted:

- Because of our small size we manager across departments. I as a front office manager I am responsible for front office activities and house-keeping while the food and beverages manager is responsible for the kitchen, bars, restaurants, conferencing and banqueting. Most of these hotels have done away with the post of supervisors.

Another notable management innovation was computerized management system. It was noted that one hotel managed its employees through a Closed Circuit Television (CCTV). The system was installed in the general manager's office and it allowed him to monitor the hotel's activities and operations from one point. The system was viewed as a cost cutting measure. According to the manager there was no need for the organization to employ many managers. If ever there was anything that needed to be drawn to the attention of the staff, the manager just picked a telephone and advised him or her of what needed to be done over the telephone. The manager appeared also to be excited about the system. When asked about the efficiency and effectiveness of the system M3 from H4 remarked:

- The system is very effective and efficient. Just last week I fired one member of staff whom I caught stealing. I picked it on the camera. If I am away, when I come back I replay the tape so as to see what has been taking place in my absence.

The above findings suggested that small to medium size independent hotels in Harare had done little in terms of management or organizational innovations in the past five years.

6. Discussion

6.1. Theme Two: Types of Innovations Implemented by Small to Medium Size Independent Hotels in Harare

This section discusses the findings on types of innovations implemented by small to medium size independent hotels in Harare in the past five years.

6.2. Sub Theme One: Marketing Innovations

The study revealed that small to medium size independent hotels in Harare generally focused more on marketing innovations than on any other forms of innovation. In the context of this study, marketing innovations are meant to help the firm understand the clients' needs and help boost sales.

In an effort to productively market their products and services most of these hotels have adopted various strategies. Small to medium size independent hotels marketed their products and services through networking. They also adopted the social media as a marketing communications tool. They have moved away from the traditional methods of marketing. They regularly update their clients on new developments through Facebook; WhatsApp; twitter and linked-in. One manager noted that some customers preferred giving their feedback and comments on service quality through the social media. Social media and networking were viewed by the small to medium size independent hotels in Harare as very powerful marketing tools in this age of modern technology. Moving away from traditional marketing methods to modern methods was noted as one of the innovations achieved in the past five years.

Another marketing innovation achieved by small to medium size hotels in the past five years was segmenting the market. The findings revealed that some hotels were now mainly targeting two main groups, the middle class group as well as top class executives like top government executives and top corporate executives. The hotels have come up with two types of bars. The setup of the two bars is different. Of the two bars, one is referred to as a noisy bar and the other as a quiet bar. It emerged that the noisy bar attracted middle aged working class group and the quiet bar had no television in it and it attracts top government executives and top corporate executives. This suggests that there is need for these hotels to articulate the different needs for the different market segments.

Offering personalized services was another marketing strategy adopted by small to medium size independent hotels in Harare. Most of the small to medium size independent hotels in Harare believed that being small gave them a competitive advantage over their competitors as they could offer more personalized services. Some of the managers pointed out that their products and services and work processes were not affected by the strategies of their competitors. They argued that their strength lay in giving their customers that personal touch through providing more personalized services unlike the big chain hotels.

Competitive pricing was another marketing strategy employed by small to medium size independent hotels in promoting their products. These hotels set their price considering the competition around; facilities offered; location and the target market.

The study findings indicated that small to medium size independent hotels were making efforts in addressing customers' needs with the objective of increasing the hotel's sales. The findings affirm what Hankinton (2004) noted that marketing innovations are meant to enhance the relationship between the firm and its clients resulting in better sales.

6.3. Sub Theme Two: Product Innovations

With regard to product innovations, the study revealed that small to medium size independent hotels in Harare had made some efforts to enhance their product portfolio. The rooms that were carpeted had been tiled and rooms that used to share toilets had been converted to en-suites. It also emerged that some hotels had recently got gyms and recreational areas which area mini spa where there is a hairdresser, manicurist and beauty therapist.

Another development noted has been in the area of culinary arts where small to medium size independent hotels have improved their cuisine by offering special and unique cuisine for their customers. The findings revealed that in the past five years some hotels had introduced a variety of cuisine like the Italian cuisine, East African cuisine and local traditional cuisine. The findings suggest that small to medium size independent hotels in Harare are conscious that product innovation is an essential component of competitiveness and a fundamental instrument of growth as alluded to by Gunday et al (2011) who says product innovation is an essential component of competitiveness. They further consider product innovation as one of the fundamental growth strategies to enter new markets, to increase the existing market share and to provide the company with a competitive edge. However, it is worrying to observe that among the products developed by small to medium size independent hotels in Harare, none of the new tourism products developed in recent years had been noted. These included loyalty programmes and environmentally sustainable accommodation facilities noted by Hjalager (2010).

6.4. Sub Theme Three: Process Innovations

In terms of process innovations, the findings show that in the past five years there has been some process innovations, though little, done by small to medium size independent hotels in Harare. The findings revealed that small to medium size independent hotels have shifted away from the manual system of booking to computer based system.

It also emerged that managers used to operate without internet but they now had internet and they were able to email their quotations and made orders online. It was also encouraging to note that some hotels had introduced some major process innovations in tourism like computerized management and monitoring systems. The system was viewed as a cost cutting measure. The findings indicate that small to medium size independent hotels realise how crucial process innovations are in the management of business as confirmed by Hjalager (2010) who notes that process innovations are intended to lower costs and enhance service quality.

6.5. Sub Theme Four: Management/ Organizational Innovations

The study revealed that small to medium size independent hotels in Harare had done little in terms of management or organizational innovations in the past five years. They came up with an organizational structure which was completely different from the usual hotel structure. It was noted that because of their small size departments had been merged such that managers managed across departments or areas for instance the Front office manager was responsible for front office activities and house-keeping while the Food and Beverages manager was now responsible for the kitchen, bars, restaurants, conferencing and banqueting. The hotels had done away with the post of supervisors.

The fact that little had been done in terms of management or organizational innovations suggested that probably small to medium size hotels had a challenge in realizing the importance of management innovations in improving a firm's performance as alluded to by Ottenbacher and Gnoth (2005) who note that organizational innovations increase a firm's performance by reducing administration costs or transaction costs, improving workplace satisfaction, gaining access to non-tradable assets or reducing costs of supplies. Hjalager (2010) also notes that management innovations consist of new job profiles, collaborative structures, and authority systems often in combination with the introduction of new products, services and production technologies. They deal with ways of organizing internal collaboration, directing and empowering staff, building careers and compensating work with pay and benefits. The findings also suggest that probably the management is not well conversant with the management innovations and their importance in the management of business.

6. Conclusions and Recommendations

The current study has explored the innovative patterns of small to medium size hotels in Harare, Zimbabwe in the past five years. It can be concluded that small to medium size hotels in Harare, Zimbabwe are moderately innovative. The study strongly supports the importance of innovation in ensuring the growth and competitiveness of small to medium size hotels. Innovation will go a long way in securing competitive advantage of small to medium size hotels in Zimbabwe. However, the study has a small sample size which is restrictive and the results' generalizability is limited to the particular population in Harare, Zimbabwe. The study was also a single industry study and it was too narrow in scope presenting also problems in generalizing the results and using the findings for theory building. It is recommended that further studies are to be conducted across a number of industries and compare the results across different industries and in the same industry over time.

7. References

- i. Carlsen, J. (2006). Global wine tourism. Wallington: CABI
- ii. Chidoko, C., Makuyana, G., Matungamire, P. & Bemani, J. (2011). Impact of the informal sector on the current Zimbabwean economic environment. *Journal of Economics and Research*. 1(1), 26-28.
- iii. Christie, I. T. & Crompton, D. E. (2001). Tourism in Africa. Africa Region Working Paper Series No. 12. <http://www.worldbank.org/afr/wps/wp12.pdf>. Date of access: 13 February 2013.
- iv. Dadura A.M. & Lee .T. (2011). Measuring the innovation ability of Taiwan's food industry using DEA. *The European Journal of Social Science Research*, 24(1), 151-172.
- v. Dooley, L. & O'sullivan, D. (2007). Managing within distributed innovation networks. *International Journal of Innovation Management*, 11(3) 397-416
- vi. Dumbu, E. & Musingafi, M. (2010). Business statistics for beginners. Deutschland: Lambert academic publishing GmbH and company:
- vii. Enz, C.A. & Siguaw, J.A. (2006). Innovations in hotel practice. *Cornell Hotels and Restaurants Administration Quarterly*, 44(4/5), 115-123.
- viii. Freel, M.S. (2000). Barriers to product innovation in small manufacturing firms. *International Small Business Journal*, 18(2), 60-80.
- ix. Gunday, A., Kandah, P. & Ranch, L. (2011). Product innovation and mastering marketplace. *Journal of Management*. 9(7), 36-42.
- x. Hankinton, G. (2004). Relational network brands. *Journal of Vacation Marketing*, 10(2), 109-121.
- xi. Jong, J.P.J. & Vermeulen, P.A.M. (2006). Determinants of product innovation in small firms: a comparison across industries, *International Small Business Journal*, 24 (6) 587-609
- xii. Hjalager, A.M. (2010). A review of innovation research in tourism. *Tourism Management Journal*, 31(1), 1-12.
- xiii. Le, Y., Hollenhorst, S., Harris, C., McLaughlin, W. & Shook, S. (2006). Environmental management. A study of Vietnamese hotels. *Annals of Tourism Research*, 33(2), 545-567.
- xiv. Leiponen, A. (2005). Organisation of knowledge and innovation: the case of Finnish business services. *Industry and Innovation Journal*, 12 (2), 185-203.
- xv. Mkono, M. (2010). Zimbabwean hospitality students' experiences of sexual harassment in the hotel industry. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 29(4), 729-735.
- xvi. Morais, D.B., Dorsch, M.J. and Backman, S.J. (2004). Can tourism providers buy their customers' loyalty? *Journal of Travel Research*, 42(3), 235-243.
- xvii. Nicolau, J.L. and Santa-Maria, M.J. (2013). The effect of hotel innovation on market value. *International Journal of Hospitality Management*, 32(1), 71-79.
- xviii. OECD (2005). Oslo manual-guidelines for collecting and interpreting innovation data. 3rd ed .Paris: OECD Publishing.

- xix. Ottenbacher, M. & Gnoth, J. (2005). How to develop successful hospitality innovation. *Cornell Hotel and Restaurant Administration Quarterly* 46 (2), 205-222.
- xx. Rusike, V. & Chitambara, P. 2012. Organising in the Zimbabwe Hospitality Sector. Retrieved from <http://www.lrs.org.za/docs/2012%20Hospitality%20Zimbabwe%20LEDRIZ.pdf> on 20 February 2015.
- xxi. Ruzivo Trust, 2013. Tourism Fact Sheet. Retrieved from http://www.google.co.bw/url?url=http://www.ruzivo.co.zw/publications/factsheets.html%3Fdownload%3D17:Tourism%2520Factsheet_PIP6&rct=j&frm=1&q=&esrc=s&sa=U&ei=OOjIVM6uA9juaKPXgvgC&ved=0CDsQFjAIOAo&usg=AFQjCNGLNNZk9IDYCBahhg6P-dGLAm6XSQ on 19 February 2015.
- xxii. Sandvik, I.L. & Sandvik, K. (2003). The impact of market orientation on product innovativeness and business performance, *International Journal of Research in Marketing*, 20 (4) 255-376
- xxiii. Thomas, R., Shaw, G. & Page, S. (2011). Understanding small firms in tourism: A perspective on research trends and challenges. *Tourism management journal*, 32(1), 963-976.