THE INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF HUMANITIES & SOCIAL STUDIES

The European Union (EU) Energy Policy Challenges and the Way Forward

Anyaelezu Somachi

International Oil and Gas Lawyer, Llb, Bl, Llm - Aberdeen, Scotland

Abstract:

Europe considers energy a top priority considering the fact that Europe depends heavily on foreign imports of its oil and gas. Ensuring and safeguarding security of supply in Europe are two long-term important targets of the Union's energy policy. The 28-Member State European Union (EU) has been a growing natural gas consumers and involves in importing of its gas for ages. Its production rate kept on reducing as years go by, thereby increasing its dependency on foreign imports. Natural gas is a regional product with regional buyers and sellers exercising control over it, quite different from other resources. This work is a review of the possible challenges faced by the European Union (EU) Energy Policy in the area of complexity and ambiguity of shared energy competence, the inconsistent issues arsing in the EU energy market and the lack of solidarity among Member States.

Further, it will consider security of supply, diversification of gas imports and supply routes, a functional EU energy market, liberalisation of the energy market, an integrated EU energy market, Renewable Energy (RE) mix and many more as the way forward to achieving a hinged free EU policy.

Keywords: European Union Policy, European Union, Energy supply, diversification of supply, Renewable Energy, Member States, External and Internal Energy Market

1. Introduction

April, 2017.

Energy issues will define the politics of the 21st century, knowing that energy could become really scarce in a growing economy; the battle for energy may even become a matter of survival of war and peace. The European Union (EU) faces serious energy challenges concerning sustainability and greenhouse gas emissions as well as security of supply, import dependence and the competitiveness and effective implementation of the internal energy market.

2. The European Union (EU) Energy Policy and Its Challenges

Following the Treaty of Lisbon, the Treaty on the functioning of the European Treaty (TFEU), they provided competence in the area of energy -which is shared among the Member States and the EU.

The Lisbon Treaty introduces the energy chapter in the TFEU recognising powers of the EU to develop an energy policy. The energy chapter of the treaty makes it possible for the EU to develop a more strategic and harmonised energy policy to be implemented by the Union as a whole. Article 194 of TFEU (1) sets up the policy framework of the EU energy policy and states four objectives guiding its development.

Thus, in the context of the establishment and the functioning of the international market and with regard to the need to preserve and improve the environment, Union policy on Energy shall aim in a spirit of solidarity between Member States to:

- a) Ensure the functioning of the energy market;
- b) Ensure security of energy supply in the Union;
- c) Promote energy efficiency, energy saving and the development of new and renewable forms of energy; and
- d) Promote the interconnection of energy networks.²

It has been observed that the European Union does not have any single coherent energy policy. In other words, there is no integrated EU energy policy. It is rather a basket of a number of policies that are connected to energy markets and energy issues.³ This to the opinion of many writers makes it even more complex and complicated.⁴

202 Vol 5 Issue 4 April, 2017

¹ The European Files, "Security of energy supply in Europe: The adaptation", available @>http://ec.europa.eu/energy/publications/doc/20110601 the European files en.pdf>accessed 12th, April 2017.

The Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU) (Lisbon Treaty); Client Earth, Justice for The Planet, The impact of the Lisbon Treaty on climate and energy policy-an environmental perspective, available @>http://www.clientearth.org/reports/clientearth-briefing-lisbon-treaty-impact-on-climate-and-energy-policy.pdf>accessed 12th

³ EU Energy Policy and the Arctic Region, "Balancing Interest between Environmental Responsibility and Resource Dependence", (December 2010) European Energy and Environmental Law Review, Vol.19, Issue 6, p.295-305

Thus, this work shows that the EU Policy is in a state of chaos considering its competence on energy, the place and the role of Member States and the EU energy market.⁵

2. European Union Challenges

2.1. European Union Energy Competence

The EU's competence on energy is majorly provided in the EU treaties. This provides the basis for any action they take (from Article 2 to 6 of the treaty on the functioning of the European Union outlines some of these competences). This entails looking at the areas where the EU Treaties directly apply to the Member States with no need for any further action by the EU institutions. The EU can only act within the limits of the competence conferred on it by the Treaties, and where the Treaties do not confer competence on the EU they remain with the Member States.

For the first time, the Treaty defines the different categories of the EU's competence as being exclusive, shared and supporting.⁸ Exclusive competence means that the Union has the responsibility to legislate and the Members States are only able to do so if they are empowered by the Union or for the implementation of the Union Acts.⁹ Shared responsibility means that legislation and policy are formulated jointly by the EU and the Member states.¹⁰ Article 2 to 6 of the TFEU lists the perspective areas of each type.

In relation to the policies where the Community already had competences, the Treaty only provides a codification of the situation.¹¹ For instance, it codifies the EU environmental competence, which remains a shared responsibility. The Treaty explicitly mentions new areas of EU competence such as energy as a shared competence and civil protection as supporting competence.¹²

2.2. Role of Member States

What seems to be a shortcoming as provided in Article 194(2) and (3) which provides the Member States rights in deciding on the conditions for exploiting their energy resources, choices amongst different energy sources and the general structure of their energy supply are subject to unanimity. In addition, Member States retain the right to conduct their bilateral energy relations with non-EU countries as they deem fit, although these relations are subject to the general obligations of sincere cooperation and competition rules apply. For example, to the import and transit of energy. ¹³

However, the Lisbon Treaty helped to formalize the shared ownership of EU energy Policy between the EU institutions and the Member States as regards "(a) carefully crafted compromise between national sovereignty over national resources, the energy taxation issues and a shared Union competence for the rest". 14

Further, the Lisbon Treaty essentially grants the EU a new binding legislative role in energy issues.¹⁵ It however reserves the rights of the member countries to determine their own conditions for exploitation, choice of energy sources and the general structures of energy supply.¹⁶ As Member States may exercise their competence in the area only in so far as the EU has not exercised or has decided not to exercise its own competence.¹⁷

Comprehensively, there is an apprehension that by the drive of the new role, the EU may also involve itself in commercial negotiations over prices and quantities. ¹⁸ While the EU Energy Commissioner Gunther Oettinger sought to reassure Member States

⁴ Ibid.

⁵ Ibid

⁶ The Energy Review (DECC), "The Review of the Balance of Competences", available @>https://wconsultation.decc.gov.uk/decc-policy/balance-of-competence-energy-review/user uploads/call-for-evidence---final.pdf-2>accessed 25th February, 2017.

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ Client Earth, legal briefing, "The impact of the Lisbon Treaty on climate and energy policy- an environmental perspective", (January, 2010), available @>http://www.clientearth.org/reports/clientearth-briefing-lisbon-treaty-impact-on-climate-and-energy-policy-pdf.> accessed 10th March, 2017.

⁹ Ibid.

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Philipp Kiiver, "Treaty of Lisbon, the National Parliaments and the Principle of Subsidiarity", (2008) 15 Maastricht J.Eur.& Comp.L.77, available @>http://europa.eu/lisbon_treaty/index_en.htm>accessed 4th April, 2017.

¹² Ibid.

¹³ Jan Frederik Braun, "EU Energy Policy under the Treaty of Lisbon Rules Between a new policy and business as usual", Working Paper N0.31/February 2011, EPIN, available @>http://www.ceps.eu, accessed>12th April, 2017.

¹⁴ Kaczy!ski, P.M.D Akule, M.Braun, P.o Broin, K.E.Georgiou, F. Langdal, A.ada, A.Moller, A.Primatarova, G.Ricard-Nihoul, A. Schout and A.Siitonen, "Lisbon Five Months On: Surveying the New EU Political Scene", (April 2010) EPIN Commentary N0.5, Centre for European Policy Studies, Brussels.

Andoura, S. L. Hancher and M.Vander Woude, "Towards an European Energy Community: A Policy Proposal" (March 2010) Notre Europe Studies & Research 76, Notre Europe, Paris, available @>http://www.europarl.europa.eu/meetdocs/2009 2014/documents/envi/dv/201/201006/20100602 envi study energy policy en.pdf>accessed 27th March, 2017.

Europa, "Division of competences within the European Union", available @>http://europa.eu/legislation summaries/institutional affairs/treaties/lisbon treaty/ai0020 en.htm>accessed 27th March, 2017.

18 Ibid p. 39.

that the Commission was 'not making a power grab', but was responding to the conclusions of the European Council of February 2011. ¹⁹ The EU is yet to correct this misapprehension. ²⁰

Notably too, the Treaty is ambiguous on the legal basis for the Union's external action on energy and where to draw the line in the mix of the Union's and Member States' competences.²¹ By creating a shared competence in the area, the Treaty has invited them to work jointly. There is however a lot that remains to be done in order to build on the shared competence so as to strengthen the EU energy policies.

2.3. European Union Energy Market

2.3.1.1. Internal European Union Energy Market

An integrated EU energy market is the most cost-effective way to ensure and secure affordable supplies to EU citizens and mitigate climate change.²² A completed internal energy market could bring net economic benefits between 16 and 40 billion Euros each year.²³ Substantial progress has been achieved to date but in order to reap full benefits, more investments are needed in strategic cross-border infrastructure, and developing smart grids for energy resources.²⁴

So far, the EU has taken mainly an internally oriented perspective on the security of supply. Its objective has been to create a single, integrated European energy market in order to realise more competitive prices, improve infrastructure and facilitate cooperation in case of an energy supply crisis.²⁵

Just like the 2009 European Energy Program for Recovery (EEPR),²⁶ launched as the EU's contribution to the global effort to deal with the financial and energy crisis of 2008.²⁷ It was introduced to promote security of supply through integration of energy networks within the EU as well as the further diversification of EU's energy sources and routes.²⁸ The Communication of 11 March 2009,²⁹ examines the progress in transporting the second package of measures relating to the internal energy market.³⁰

Completing the Internal Energy Market by building integrated European Energy network undoubtedly has not been successful.³¹ According to experts, however, it has greatly improved over the last couple of years, but it is still not successful for an integrated energy market to be in place.³² Obviously, apart from a legal framework, the EU also needs a real, physical infrastructure, i.e. Crossborder energy interconnectors between Member States.

To create a genuine internal market for energy is one of the EU's priority objectives.³³ The existence of a competitive internal energy market is a strategic instrument in terms both of giving European consumers a choice between different companies supplying gas and electricity at reasonable prices and of making the market accessible for all suppliers, especially the smallest and those investing in renewable forms of energy.³⁴ There is also the issue of setting up a framework within which the mechanism for CO2 emission trading can function properly. Making the internal energy market a reality will depend above all on having a reliable and coherent energy network in Europe and therefore on infrastructure investment.³⁵ A truly integrated market will contribute to the diversification of energy and enhance energy security.³⁶

However, the problem is that every country interprets the notion "energy security" in its own way. We can obviously see a complexity of the energy security perception in the EU; it includes among others: current threats of energy trade worldwide, terrorism, the rise of

¹⁹ Jan Frederik Braun (n13)

²⁰ Ibid.

²¹ Andoura (n15) p.3.

²² De Jong, J. Maters, H. Scheepers, M. Seebregts, "A 2007 EU Standards for Energy Security of Supply", ECN-E-07-004/CIEP.

²³ Ibid.

²⁵ Ibid.

²⁶ EC Report, "The Implementation of the European Energy Programme Recovery", (Brussels, 8th August, 2012) COM (2012) 445 final, available @>http://ec.europa.eu/energy/eepr/doc/com 2012 0445 en.pdf. The initiative is now embodied in Council Regulation 663/2009/EC establishing a programme to aid economic recovery by granting Community financial assistance to projects in the field of energy (2009)OJL 200/31.

²⁷ Ibid p.2.

²⁸ EC Report (n26).

²⁹ COM (2009) 115 Final-Not Published in the Official Journal.

³⁰ Ibid.

³¹ Ibid.

³² Ibid.

³³ Summary of EU Legislation, "Internal Energy Market", available @>http://europa.eu/legislation summaries/energy/internal energy market/index en.htm>accessed 20th March, 2017.

³⁴ Ibid.

³⁵ Ibid.

³⁶ Harman Van Rompuy, "Development in European Governance and European Energy Policy", In European Commission, "Security of Energy Supply in Europe: Continuous Adaptation", (Ma-June 2011) The European Files, p.6, available @>http://ec.europa.eu/energy/publications/doc/20110601_the_european_files_en.pf>accessed 7th April, 2017.

new powerful economies drastically changing the situation on the market, and the vulnerability of supply chains.³⁷ Other risks include the effects on the EU internal energy market of external actors not playing by the same market rules nor being subject to the same competitive pressures domestically.³⁸

2.3.1.2. External European Union Energy Market

The objectives of an EU external energy policy are quite clear cut (i.e. first of all security and diversification of energy supply). The externalisation of the EU's internal energy market has in that context been presented as a means to ensure energy security.

The EU external energy market plays an important role in the three key energy objectives of the European Union (EU) i.e. security of supply, competitiveness and sustainability). It has over the years been working towards transparency in energy agreements with non-EU Countries, developing an energy partnership with key partner countries to improve its external energy market. 40

In the EU's external representation for furthering cooperation and dialogue with non-EU countries and regions, however, a hybrid negotiating format has been put in place. The negotiation team here is tripartite: the high representative and the energy commissioner flanked by the presidency of the Council of the European Union. A clear example in this regard is the EU-US Energy Council, which was established in November 2009. During a summit of this Council in November 2010, the EU represented by High Representative Ashton with Energy Commissioner Oettinger in a secondary role. The recent Energy 2020 strategy for competitive, sustainable and secure energy proposed by the Commission further more underlines that the external dimension of EU energy policy must be consistent and mutually reinforcing with other external activities of the EU.

3. The Way Forward

Security of supply is one of the main objectives of EU energy policy. It combines measures of energy import diversification, the political risks of the supplying country, risk associated with energy transit and the economic impact of a supply disruption. EU external sources. 46

One of the most important EU gas suppliers remains Russia.⁴⁷ The dependence on Russia for gas supply is one of the concerns for EU within the subject of energy.⁴⁸ This is as a result of a strong interest exhibited by Russia to use its resources for political end.⁴⁹ Over the past decade, officials of the EU have become more concerned about the disruption of Russian natural gas supplies to Europe. The EU was woken from sleep by the interruption of its energy supplies from Russia, when on January 1, 2006; gas supply to Ukraine from Russia was cut for four (4) days. This was because Russia was unable to reach a new agreement with Ukraine as regards natural gas prices and fees for transit, the national gas company in Russia (GAZPROM) cut exports to Ukraine. This incident was the first time energy supplies from Russia in EU's history were affected by political and economic reasons and not by technical reasons.⁵⁰ Despite the fact that this break in gas supply was short as gas was quickly restored in trans-Ukraine pipeline, series of further events continued to raise questions in Europe about reliability of Russian energy supplies.

In the following year, a similar crisis ensued between Russia and Belarus, which led to the cut-off of Belarusian gas supplies by Russia. To heighten the situation, in 2009, gas supplies was cut-off through Ukraine for a long time again by Russia, following its gas

205 Vol 5 Issue 4 April, 2017

³⁷ Ibid

³⁸ Ibid.

³⁹ EC Communication, "Security of Energy Supply and International Cooperation-The EU Energy Policy: Engaging with partners beyond our borders", (Brussels, 7th March, 2017) COM (2011) 539 Final, p.18, available @>http://eurlex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=COM:2011:0539:FIN:EN:PDF>accessed 15th March, 2017.

⁴¹ Jan Frederik Braun, " EU Energy Policy under the Treaty of Lisbon Rules between a new policy and business as usual", EPIN RULES, Working Paper, N0.31/February 2011.

⁴² Ibid.

⁴³ Sefcovic. M, "The EU's institutional evolution since the entering into force of the Lisbon Treaty", Speech at the Bureau of European Policy Advisors, Brussels, (9th February 2011), available @>https://www.coleurope.eu/sites/default/files/uploads/page/edp/ 3 2013 metais.pdf>accessed 10th April, 2107.

⁴⁴ Ibid.

⁴⁵ Chloe Le Coqa, Elena Paltseva, " Measuring the security of external energy supply in the European Union', (November 2009) Energy Policy, Volume 37, Issue 11, p.4474-4481.

⁴⁶ S. S Haghighi, "Energy Supply: The external legal relations of the European Union with the Major Oil and Gas Supplying Countries", (Hart Publishing, 2008) p.11.

⁴⁷ Umut Turksen, "The EU and Russia energy trade-thickening of legality and solidarity?' (2012) I International Energy Law Review, Volume 5, Issue 1, p.11-15.

⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹ Ibid.

⁵⁰ Alan Riley, "Energy Security, Gas Market Liberalisation and our Energy Relations with Russia" in, Christain Egenhofer, Leonid Grigoriev Vladmir Socor, Alan Riley, "European Energy Security, What Should it mean? What to do?" (2006) ESF Working Paper N0.23.

dispute with Ukraine.⁵¹ This was heavily frowned at by the EU leaders. This led to the establishment under the Lisbon Treaty of the Regulation 994/2010 to ensure that Member States can withstand gas supply crisis for at least a period of 30 days.⁵²

The gas crises between Russia and Ukraine in 2006 and 2009 taught the EU that the traditional economic approach had reached its limits and that new policies in the energy sector were urgently needed.⁵³ Following the reviews and the subsequent Lisbon treaty, the security of energy supply was given a legal basis for future developments in this policy field.⁵⁴ In response to the political crisis in Ukraine and the overall importance of a stable and abundant supply of energy for the EU's citizens and economy, the European Commission has released an EU energy security strategy on 28th May 2014.⁵⁵ This strategy is based on an in-depth study of Member States' energy dependence.⁵⁶

An important pillar in the EU's external energy market is the diversification of gas imports and supply routes by strategic projects of "Common European Interest" in order to curtail European vulnerability, especially through its major, yet presumably unreliable supplier and transit state.⁵⁷ The EU's strategy goes beyond the rationale of mere physical diversification; it seeks to prescribe supplies, volumes, routes and import corridors with a common liberal regulatory transit framework along the whole pipeline corridor, based on EU norms such as the Third Party Access (TPA), market tariff pricing and investment protection.⁵⁸

Consequently, well-functioning EU energy markets are the best way of ensuring safe and affordable security of energy supplies. This will provide a resilient and responsive EU energy supply, facilitate investment decisions, cushion shocks and provide security for both customers and procedures. But markets do not operate in a vacuum; they need physical and legal infrastructure, as well as information, transparency and the active participation of major players. To achieve transparency in external energy dealings, the EU requires its Member States to share information on their energy transactions with third countries. In July 2012, a draft decision was prepared by the parliament recommending the establishment of a new information exchange system to enable the Commission examine bilateral energy agreements by Member States with third countries for conformity with the EU Law. The objective of the system is to promote transparency with regard to such agreements and thereby allow the Union to take coordinated action. This again has been perceived as a limitation by the Member States in its bilateral and multilateral agreements and policies. This is because of the fact that their freedom has been limited by these rules.

Furthermore, the EU can also achieve transparency by extending its own energy market to include its neighbours within a common regulatory area with shared trade, transit and environmental rules.⁶³ Also, by unbundling of networks and being able to take away management of networks from State control and enhance increased interconnections, thereby making energy available through cross-border interconnections.⁶⁴ This is more so as liberalisation of market and security of supply are connected, since the bigger the energy market, the greater the security of supply.

⁵¹ Ibid.

Haghighi S.S, "Energy Security and the Division of Competence between the European Community and its Member States", (2008), European Law Journal, Vol.14, Issue 4, P.1-5.

Raphael Metais, "Department of EU International relations and Diplomacy studies Ensuring Department of EU International Relations and Diplomacy Studies", available @>https://coleurope.eu/sites/default/files/uploads/page/edp 3 2013 metais.pdf>accessed 1st March, 2017.

⁵⁴ Ibid.

⁵⁵ Ibid.

⁵⁶ Haghighi (n52)

OXPO Working Paper, "The Limits of Convergence with EU Energy Norms in the Neighbourhood OXPO-Oxford Sciences Pro Research Group", available @>http://oxpo.politics.ox.ac.uk>accessed 10th, April, 2017.

Weber Bernd, "The EU's external energy policy and the neighbouring suppliers Azerbaijan and Algeria: Is the pipeline half full or half empty?" (2014), CERI Dossiers, forthcoming>accessed 7th March, 2017.

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ European Parliament, "Report on the proposal for a decision of the European Parliament and of the Council setting up an information exchange mechanism with regard to intergovernmental agreements between Member States and third countries in the field of energy '', (COM (2011) 0540-C7-0235/2011-2011/0238 (COD)), available

^{@&}gt;http://www.europarl.europa.eu/sides/getDoc.do?pubRef=-//EP//NONSGML+REPORT+A7-2012-0264+0+DOC+PDF+V0//EN>accessed 5th March, 2017.

⁶¹ Ibid.

⁶² Ibid.

An external policy to serve Europe's energy interests", Paper from Commission/SG/HR for the European Council facing external energy risk S160/6> available @>http://ec.europa.eu/dgs/energy transport/international/doc/paper solana sg energy en.pdf> accessed 20th March, 2017.

⁶⁴ International Energy Agency," European Union is leading on climate change and energy policies, but needs to increase funding for energy research & development", (4th September, 2008), available

^{@&}gt;http://www.iea.org/newsroomandevents/pressreleases/2008/september/name,20250,en.html>accessed 7th, April 2017.

There is also an ambitious target under the EU energy 2020 scheme of growing the share of renewable energy sources to 20%. The Renewable sources contribute to EU's pursuit of energy security by reducing dependence on foreign supplies which is likely to escalate to over 70% by 2030. EU's pursuit of energy security by reducing dependence on foreign supplies which is likely to escalate to over 70% by 2030.

In 2009, the Climate and Energy Package was adopted laying the foundation of a strategy aimed at fighting against climate change and making a shift in energy mix by Europe. Here Europe is trying to lift its domestic energy production, without increasing green house gas emissions (GHGE), while reducing import dependence by the EU in the long run.⁶⁷

More widely, the EU should advocate reciprocity in market opening and respect for market rules: non discrimination, competition, transparency and enforcement. EU energy security can be enhanced by diversifying energy sources and geographical origin as well as transit routes. 69

The EU should also facilitate the maintenance and upgrade of existing energy infrastructure in neighbouring countries of key importance to the EU as well as the development of new infrastructure.⁷⁰

Attempts to pursue an energy security based on opening up access to suppliers' markets and liberalising investment conditions have had mixed results as government and firms in producing countries have sought to maintain or extend control over their energy assets.⁷¹ Inside the EU, some Member States remain resilient on the idea of a full liberalisation of market conditions, obviously preferring to support their 'national champions and campaigns'.⁷²

4. Conclusion

The new IEA report said there remains much room for improvements. It note that much of the integration of Europe's energy market has been confined to Northern and Western parts of Europe, and that until important interconnections are built across the entire bloc, the EU will not have a truly integrated, single energy network- the basis for an "Energy Union". 73

Considering the realities of the issues considered above, ranging from the complexity and ambiguity of the shared competence, to the inconsistent issues arising in the internal energy market as a result of selfish interest of Member States, coupled with lack of solidarity between them which has really affected the external energy market. One could be pushed to say that the European energy policy is in chaos because of this lack of proper coordination.

If Member States are united and build an internal energy market together, this will not only benefit its citizens and industry, but it will also demonstrate to Russia that it has exceeded the limits of the EU's tolerance. To make the most of the diversity of its energy sources, and to move towards an Energy Union, the EU must better pool its resources within the internal energy market to enhance both energy security and the competitiveness of its industry. Another step is to find alternative sources of supply from outside the EU. The EU can only succeed if all Member States stick together and start implementing a common energy policy. This also means that Member States must include energy efficiency measures in their national energy plans. Increasing energy efficiency across the EU would not only help to decrease dependency on foreign energy imports, but would also reduce energy costs for consumers and bring down EU emissions. It is time for all EU Member States to recognise that they are stronger together than alone when dealing with energy security.

The EU further needs to achieve a more systematic, structured and coherent use of the full set of foreign policy instruments that could contribute to the development and strengthening of the Union's external relations in the field of energy (i.e. CFSP, trade agreements, development policy association treaties, the energy community with South-Eastern European countries, enlargement process, European neighbourhood policy, strategic partnerships, etc.), should play an active role in better coordinating the EU's external energy market.⁷⁴

207 Vol 5 Issue 4 April, 2017

⁶⁵ Commission of the European Communities, "Action Plan for Energy Efficiency: Realising the potentials", Brussels, 19.10.2006, COM (2006) 545 final, available @>http://ec.europa.eu/energy/action plan energy efficiency/doc/com 2006 0545 en.pdf> accessed 5th April 2017.

⁶⁶ Ibid.

⁶⁷ Camilla Adelle, Marc Pallemaerrts and Joana Chinavari, "Climate Change and Energy Security in Europe: Policy Integration and its Limits", (2009) (1651-8942) SIEPS.

⁶⁸ Ibid.

⁶⁹ Sami Andoura (Senior research fellow), Foreign Policy an external energy Strategy for the EU notre Europe Agata Hinc "low emission economy" Project leader, demos Europa, available @>http://www.notre-europe.eu/media/tgae20116candourahinc.pdf?pdf=ok> accessed 12th April, 2017.

[&]quot; Ibid

⁷¹ Francis McGowan, "Can the European Union's Market Liberalism Ensure Energy Security in a Time of Economic Nationalism?", (2008) JCER, Volume 4, Issue 2, pg.90-102.

⁷² Ibid.

⁷³ International Energy Agency, "How the EU can progress towards an 'Energy Union' ", available@>http://www.iea.org/newsroomandevents/pressreleases/2014/december/how-the-eu-can-progress-towards-an-energy-union.html>accessed 29th March, 2017.

⁷⁴ Ibid.

5. References

- i. The Treaty on the functioning of the European Union (TFEU) (Lisbon Treaty)
- ii. S .S Haghighi, "Energy Supply: The external legal relations of the European Union with the Major Oil and Gas Supplying Countries", (Hart Publishing, 2008) p.11
- iii. Coqa Chloe Le, Elena Paltseva, "Measuring the security of external energy supply in the European Union', (November 2009) Energy Policy, Volume 37, Issue 11, p.4474-4481
- iv. EU Energy Policy and the Arctic Region, "A Balancing Interest between Environmental Responsibility and the Resource Dependence", (December 2010) European Energy and Environmental Law Review, Vol.19, Issue 6
- v. Francis Mc Gowan, "Can the European Union's Market Liberalism Ensure Energy Security in a time of 'Economic Nationalism'?" (2008) JCER, Volume 4, Issue 2
- vi. Haghighi S.S, "Energy Security and the Division of Competence between the European Community and its Member States", (2008), European Law Journal, Vol.14, Issue 4, P.1-5.
- vii. Umut Turksen, "The EU and Russia energy trade-thickening of legality and solidarity?' (2012) I International Energy Law Review, Volume 5, Issue 1, p.11-15.
- viii. Andoura, S. L. Hancher and M.Vander Woude, "Towards an European Energy Community: A Policy Proposal" (March 2010) Notre Europe Studies & Research 76, Notre Europe, Paris, available @>http://www.europarl.europa.eu/meetdocs/2009 2014/documents/envi/dv/201/201006/20100602 envi study energy policy en.pdf
- ix. Client Earth, legal briefing, "The impact of the Lisbon Treaty on climate and energy policy- an environmental perspective", (January, 2010), available @>http://www.clientearth.org/reports/clientearth-briefing-lisbon-treaty-impact-on-climate-and-energy-policy-pdf
- x. Commission of the European Communities, "Action Plan for Energy Efficiency: Realising the potentials", Brussels, 19.10.2006, COM (2006) 545 final, available @>http://ec.europa.eu/energy/action plan energy efficiency/doc/com 2006 0545 en.pdf> accessed 5th April 2017.
- xi. EC Communication, "Security of Energy Supply and International Cooperation-The EU Energy Policy: Engaging with partners beyond our borders", (Brussels, 7th March, 2017) COM (2011) 539 Final, p.18, available @>http://eurlex.europa.eu/LexUriServ/LexUriServ.do?uri=COM:2011:0539:FIN:EN:PDF
- xii. European Parliament, "Report on the proposal for a decision of the European Parliament and of the Council setting up an information exchange mechanism with regard to intergovernmental agreements between Member States and third countries in the field of energy '', (COM (2011) 0540-C7-0235/2011-2011/0238 (COD)), available
 @>http://www.europarl.europa.eu/sides/getDoc.do?pubRef=-//EP//NONSGML+REPORT+A7-2012-0264+0+DOC+PDF+V0//EN
- xiii. Europa, "Division of competences within the European Union", available @>http://europa.eu/legislation summaries/institutional affairs/treaties/Lisbon treaty/ai0020 en.htm
- xiv. Harman Van Rompuy, "Development in European Governance and European Energy Policy", In European Commission, "Security of Energy Supply in Europe: Continuous Adaptation", (Ma-June 2011) The European Files, p.6, available @>http://ec.europa.eu/energy/publications/doc/20110601_the_european_files_en.pf>
- xv. International Energy Agency, "How the EU can progress towards an 'Energy Union' ", available@>http://www.iea.org/newsroomandevents/pressreleases/2014/december/how-the-eu-can-progress-towards-an-energy-union.html
- xvi. International Energy Agency," European Union is leading on climate change and energy policies, but needs to increase funding for energy research & development", (4th September, 2008), available @>http://www.iea.org/newsroomandevents/pressreleases/2008/september/name,20250,en.html
- xvii. Metais. R, "Department of EU International relations and Diplomacy studies Ensuring Department of EU International Relations and Diplomacy Studies", available @>https://coleurope.eu/sites/default/files/uploads/page/edp 3 2013 metais.pdf
- xviii. Ogryzko. O, "Environment & Energy Affairs, Approaching the EU Internal Energy Market", (15th November, 2013) available @>http://www.europeanpublicaffairs.eu/approaching-the-eu-internal-energy-market>
- xix. OXPO Working Paper, "The Limits of Convergence with EU Energy Norms in the Neighbourhood OXPO- Oxford Sciences Pro Research Group", available @>http://oxpo.politics.ox.ac.uk
- xx. Philipp Kiiver, "Treaty of Lisbon, the National Parliaments and the Principle of Subsidiarity", (2008) 15 Maastricht J.Eur.& Comp.L.77, available @>http://europa.eu/lisbon_treaty/index_en.htm
- xxi. Sami Andoura (Senior research fellow), Foreign Policy an external energy Strategy for the EU notre Europe Agata Hinc "low emission economy" Project leader, demos Europa, available @>http://www.notre-europe.eu/media/tgae20116candourahinc.pdf?pdf=ok
- xxii. Sefcovic. M, "The EU's institutional evolution since the entering into force of the Lisbon Treaty", Speech at the Bureau of European Policy Advisors, Brussels, (9th February 2011), available @>https://www.coleurope.eu/sites/default/files/uploads/page/edp/ 3 2013 metais.pdf
- xxiii. Summary of EU Legislation, "Internal Energy Market", available @>http://europa.eu/legislation summaries/energy/internal energy market/index en.htm
- xxiv. The European Files, "Security of energy supply in Europe: the adaptation", available @>http://ec.europa.eu/energy/publications/doc/20110601 the European files en.pdf

- xxv. The Energy Review (DECC), "The Review of the Balance of Competences", available @>https://wconsultation.decc.gov.uk/decc-policy/balance-of-competence-energy-review/user uploads/call-for-evidence---final.pdf-2
- xxvi. The Treaty on the Functioning of the European Union (TFEU) (Lisbon Treaty); Client Earth, Justice for The Planet, The impact of the Lisbon Treaty on climate and energy policy-an environmental perspective, available @>http://www.clientearth.org/reports/clientearth-briefing-lisbon-treaty-impact-on-climate-and-energy-policy.pdf
- xxvii. An External Policy to Serve Europe's Energy Interest Paper from commission SG/HR for the European Council Facing External Energy Risk S160/06
- xxviii. Alan Riley, "Energy Security, Gas Market Liberalisation and our Energy Relations with Russia" in, Christian Egenhofer, Leonid Grigoriev Vladmir Socor, Alan Riley, "European Energy Security, What Should it mean? What to do?" (2006) ESF Working Paper N0.23
- xxix. Camilla Adelle, Marc Pallemaerrts and Joana Chinavari, "Climate Change and Energy Security in Europe: Policy Integration and its Limits", (2009) (1651-8942) SIEPS
- xxx. De Jong, Maters, H, Scheepers, M, Seebregts, A., 2007. EU Standards for Energy Security Supply, ECN-E-O7-004/CIEP
- xxxi. EC Report, "The Implementation of the European Energy Programme for Recovery' (Brussels, 8th August 2012) COM (2012) 445 final
- xxxii. Jan Frederik Braun, "EU Energy Policy under the Treaty of Lisbon Rules Between a new policy and business as usual", Working Paper N0.31/February 2011, EPIN
- xxxiii. Kaczy!ski, P.M.D Akule, M.Braun, P.o Broin, K.E.Georgiou, F. Langdal, A.ada, A.Moller, A.Primatarova, G.Ricard-Nihoul, A. Schout and A.Siitonen, "Lisbon Five Months On: Surveying the New EU Political Scene", (April 2010) EPIN Commentary N0.5, Centre for European Policy Studies, Brussels
- xxxiv. Michael Ratner & Ors, "Europe's Energy Security: Options and Challenges to Natural Gas Supply Diversification", (2012) 23 Current Politics & Economics of Europe
- xxxv. Weber Bernd, "The EU's external energy policy and the neighbouring suppliers Azerbaijan and Algeria: Is the pipeline half full or half empty?" (2014), CERI Dossiers, forthcoming