

# THE INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF HUMANITIES & SOCIAL STUDIES

## Library Training Outputs and Social Requirements: A Case Study in a Mekong Delta University, Vietnam

Dr. Huynh Thi Trang

Senior Lecturer, Department of Library and Information Management, Can Tho University, Vietnam

### **Abstract:**

*This study aims at determining the social requirements and evaluating the employer satisfaction on the librarianship undergraduates of a Mekong Delta university in Vietnam. Based on conceptual framework of ASEAN University Network - Quality Assurance (AUN-QA) program assessment, this research was conducted using a mixed-methods approach (surveying 53 employers and interviewing 20 library and information leaders who recruited Library and Information Management undergraduates). The online survey was conducted and analysed first to get emerging theme for constructing the questions of individual interviews. The purposes of individual interviews are to gain more in-depth information about what employer comments on library training outcomes and their requirements on librarianship undergraduates. SPSS was used to analyse quantitative data from the online survey. Frequency, descriptive, comparison and correlations between variables were used to identify employer satisfaction on library anship undergraduates as well as their requirements on knowledge, capacity and skills to meet the social needs. Qualitative data from online survey and interviews were added into NVivo for coding to define the emerging themes for thematical analysis. Employer satisfaction was investigated through four aspects: library professional knowledge, ICT application skills and knowledge, management skills and knowledge adapted to the organisation requirement. Librarianship undergraduates were acquired to possess eight groups of knowledge, capacities and skills. They are communication skills, teamwork skills, and independent study skills, skills of organising and analysing information, skills of providing information, ICT skills, management skills and general knowledge. These findings not only help improve the quality of library education but also contribute to enriching reference resources for the library and information training units of the country and worldwide.*

**Keyword:** Employer satisfaction, library and information management, library training outputs, social requirements, Vietnam

### **1. Introduction**

Can Tho University, the key training institute of higher education in the Mekong Delta, Vietnam currently offers 98 bachelor programs, 45 masters' and 16 doctoral programs (Can Tho University Annual Report, 2018). Given the importance of quality assessment; however, only 27 training programs have been accredited by ASEAN University Network - Quality Assurance (AUN-QA) framework. The rationale for this limitation is lack of feedback from stakeholders such as employers. The Library and Information Management (LIM) training program is not an exception. Although this program has been conducted for 11 years with 8 groups consisting of 467 undergraduates, there is no feedback on employer satisfaction. Moreover, in a recent research on 'Survey on employment situations of Library and Information Management's alumni of Can Tho University after graduation' conducted by Nguyen (2017), only feedback from LIM alumni was collected. Therefore, there is a pressing need for conducting another research to collect data from employers in order to have full assessment of the quality of LIM undergraduates to upgrade training programs.

The findings are expected to not only benefit the university, school of social sciences and humanities, LIM department, lecturers and students but also provide evidence for quality assessment of the program. In particular, the feedback from LIM alumni in the previous research together with these current findings will provide a more comprehensive picture of such LIM training program to meet the societal needs. Based on the suggestions of the employers, LIM lecturers can upgrade teaching textbooks, changing teaching methods and justifying what can be transferred to students. Current students may know what to study and what skills to be trained to prepare for their future jobs. This results in enhanced quality of the university and beliefs from the society and community on qualified human resources for the Mekong Delta, Vietnam.

### **2. Literature Review**

Nowadays, with the development of information technology and internet, libraries gradually transfer from traditional to modern style, from closed stack to open-stack, from face-to-face to distant services; therefore, staff recruitment criteria at libraries and information organizations have changed. Employers believe that library staff are not only good at professional, but also keen at foreign language and information technology (Tao, 2010). Similar to Tao's research, Bui (2013)

declares that 100% library leaders have looked for new staff with professional skills, office application skills and foreign language skills. However, they are so dissatisfied with the quality of undergraduates. In particular, Nguyen (2012) states that the outcome quality of LIM undergraduate programs is poor, unbalanced among undergraduates and employers have to spend time and effort to re-train them. More particularly, Bui (2013) claims that most of undergraduates are confused at applying professional knowledge into real work at the library. They are not confident in analysing, screening and organising information for some databases. Moreover, they are weak at compiling bibliographies and other library professional publications. Especially, Hoang (2011) complains that LIM undergraduates cannot meet the needs of library work. It is professional capacity, individual and core abilities. Among those, professional capacity includes library management and organization, information resources management, library services management, as well as tools and application of information technology into work. She is expected LIM undergraduates to master database set standards, know how to organise the library bibliographies, indexing, metadata, and know how to compile and analyse information. Furthermore, LIM undergraduates have to know and apply emerging technology into work. However, 100% LIM undergraduates do not know how to use outlook to build working schedules, individual and group work management. Moreover, she also comments that LIM undergraduates with intermediate and advanced certificates of English cannot communicate well with foreign visitors of the library. They cannot read and evaluate any information materials which are suitable or not for the users. In addition, she demands that scientific research barrier has to be removed and create more opportunities for undergraduates' creativeness with new research topic, releasing the old format such as enhancing information resources, cataloguing techniques.... In general, Hoang's paper is considered as an alarm for the quality of LIM training programs in Vietnam. All of these papers are suitable for reference to construct the questionnaire in order to investigate the employer satisfaction on LIM undergraduates of Can Tho University.

There are lots of guidelines and research on the core requirements of the LIM training program to achieve qualified outcomes satisfying the social needs. In particular, it is in the library and information guidelines, IFLA (2011) indicates that the LIM training program should have more focus on communication skills, teamwork skills, time and work management as well as analyzing and solving problem skills for students. Moreover, IFLA also suggests 10 core subjects in the LIM training program. It is required that the LIM training program should consider carefully the various needs of working places. In addition, knowledge management, information literacy, multimedia and publication knowledge should be added into the training program. Basically, LIM undergraduates have to possess knowledge and skills such as information literacy, knowledge and information management, information technology, information searching skills, research skills, communication skills, customers care, independent and group teamwork skills, and high awareness of librarianship (Vu, 2011). In the meanwhile, Bui (2011) states that soft skills play an important role in working life. They are living skills, communication skills, leadership skills, teamwork skills, time management and relaxation ... These skills are crucial because they contribute into the job successes. Similarly, Nguyen (2012) indicates that the outcomes of LIM training program should not only meet the requirements of the society but also make changes on social needs. Moreover, in order to train the relevant LIM labour force to meet the knowledge economy and information society, training institutes have to carefully consider the basic natures of the knowledge economy and information society, especially the five groups of basic knowledge that each citizen should have in European Committee of Education (T. H. Nguyen, 2013). Recently, Bui (2016) suggests to apply 4C model in LIM training program including Collectors, Creators, Consolidators, and Communicators. However, this author also claims that the training institutes should consider many aspects including the assessment of the social requirements and needs to be able to apply this 4C model. In reality, Faculty of Library and Information of University of Culture in Ha Noi has conducted a bachelor program with 5 categories: knowledge, skills, behavior, position, and continuous education after graduating (T. N. Nguyen, 2016). In general, these authors suggest different ways to upgrade the LIM training program in order to be suitable to social needs. These are the basis to reference, compare and raise suggestions when research data are collected.

In the Western countries such as America, Australia, New Zealand..., there is no LIM training program for bachelor's degree. These countries only conduct the LIM graduate programs for undergraduates from other disciplines. In consequence, papers from these countries mainly focus on requirements as well as suggestions of building LIM graduate programs. Moreover, the researcher has not found any article or paper on employer satisfaction on LIM undergraduate programs from the other countries in the world.

Meanwhile, much research has focused on employer satisfaction and knowledge and skills that undergraduates of all disciplines should have to meet societal needs. In particular, in the Republic of Slovenia, most undergraduates cannot meet the requirements of labour market. The main reason is that these bachelor programs were designed are rigid (Pavlin, 2014). In recent research in Europe, Livanos and Nuñez (2016) has indicated that students should investigate the needs of the labour market before enrolling in a course at college or university. This 'preparation' will help undergraduates gain knowledge and skills necessary for employment options or opportunities after completing courses. In England, Kupfer (2011) indicates that bachelor programs should provide undergraduates with confidence and communication skills.

In a research on higher education assessment in Egypt, Schomaker (2015) claims that skills in writing, communication, mathematics, and research, critical thinking, decision-making, evaluation, and soft skills such as ones in computers, teamwork and life-long learning are definitely trained in the university. These skills will enhance the potentials of undergraduates in their future work.

In Rumani, in a research on undergraduates and the labour markets, Palade and Constantin (2013) raise some suggestions to make undergraduates known by the recruiters. For example, alumni are invited to speak about their struggles to be successful at certain seminar; organizing volunteering programs for students; upgrading training programs to meet the social needs; and building collaboration between university and recruiters. More particular, students should

pay attention to be trained the soft skills such as communication skills, teamwork skills, activeness and customer interaction skills (Patache, 2016).

In contrast to these above points of view, recruitment criteria in Japan are completely different. In 2000's, about 95% of Japanese undergraduates looked for jobs before graduating. The recruiters even choose candidates one year before graduating date (Yoshimoto, 2000). This indicates that Japan highly appreciates the quality of the inputs of the university instead of study achievements. What plays the key role of finding jobs is the university prestige. Although there are many criticism, recruiters in Japan are still favour to undergraduates who are from most highly ranked universities where they did struggle to be in during the entrance examinations. Therefore, the date deciding the future jobs of the high school pupils after 18 years of study is the university examination day. Japanese companies recruit their employees based on ability to survive on-the-job training instead of specific knowledge or skills gained from study in the universities (Yonezawa, 2002). The deciding element of on-the-job training ability is the entrance scores into the universities.

Although these studies are from all disciplines (not related to LIM program), they are found useful for this study with regard to research design that is expected to refine the LIM training program in Can Tho University.

### 3. Conceptual Framework

At present, education training outputs are evaluated by international standard assessment frameworks. In particular, Accreditation Board for Engineering and Technology (ABET) framework consists of nine criteria. This is a non-governmental organization that accredits post-secondary education programs in applied and natural sciences. Therefore, it was not used as the conceptual framework for this research.

ASEAN University Network - Quality Assurance (AUN-QA) criteria are standards with regard to quality of education that identify measures of continuous improvement of quality of universities in Southeast Asia. It consists of 15 criteria with 68 sub-criteria. Each criterion is assessed based on 7 scales. Three of 15 criteria are related to assessment of training program outputs. They are criterion N° 13 (stakeholders' assessments), criterion N°14 (outputs) and criterion N° 15 (stakeholders' satisfactions on graduates). Components of these three criteria are used as conceptual framework to build questionnaires and interview of the research.

### 4. Methodology

This research collected data from the employers whose organisations are directly related to library and information management including the foreign organisations. They are the leaders of the libraries and information organisations where LIM undergraduates are working. The recruiters of other disciplines are not included in this research. It is because their requirements on staff knowledge, ability and skills are different from the training objectives of the LIM program. Among 467 undergraduates from 8 groups of alumni, the researcher could contact 235 ones (50%) through email, Facebook and telephone. Among them, there are 116 alumni (49.5%) working at the libraries and the organisations related to information management. About 87 alumni (37.4%) are working at private companies or business. Twenty-five alumni (10.6%) are still looking for jobs. Seven alumni (2.6%) are pursuing their second major study. Among 116 LIM undergraduates, some libraries recruited more than one undergraduate. Therefore, there are 58 employers in total. According to Krejcie and Morgan (1970), the minimum samples for this research is 51.

This research was conducted using a mixed-methods approach (surveying 53 employers and interviewing 20 library and information leaders who recruited Library and Information Management undergraduates). The online survey was conducted and analysed first to get emerging themes that guide individual interviews. The purposes of interviews are to gain in-depth information about what employer comments on library training outcomes and their requirements on librarianship undergraduates. SPSS was used to analyse quantitative data from the online survey. Frequency, descriptive, comparison and correlations between variables were used to identify employer satisfaction on librarianship undergraduates as well as their requirements on knowledge, capacity and skills to meet the societal needs. Qualitative data from online survey and interviews were organized using NVivo for coding and identifying emerging themes for thematic analysis (Boyzatis, 1998).

#### 4.1. Objectives

This study is aimed at examining the employer satisfaction on LIM undergraduates. This will help LIM Department upgrade the LIM training program and enhance the quality of the outputs of the program to meet the social needs. Specific objectives are:

- Investigating the employer feedback on the quality of LIM undergraduates of Can Tho University
- Analysing the employer requirements on undergraduate knowledge, abilities and skills before applying for jobs

#### 4.2. Research Questions

- What are employers' perceptions about the quality of LIM undergraduates of Can Tho University?
- What knowledge, abilities and skills should LIM undergraduates possess before applying for jobs?

### 5. Results

#### 5.1. Employers' Comments on the Quality of LIM Undergraduates

Employer satisfaction was investigated through 4 aspects: library professional knowledge, ICT application skills and knowledge, management skills and knowledge adapted to the organisation requirement (see Table 1). Evaluation

scales are ①Very unsatisfied, ②Unsatisfied, ③Satisfied, ④Somewhat satisfied, and ⑤Very satisfied. The results indicated that 96.5% employers have satisfied with LIM undergraduates' professional knowledge (calculated by assessed points in 'satisfied', 'somewhat satisfied' and 'very satisfied' levels). ICT application skills and knowledge were highly assessed with 100% from 'satisfied' to 'very satisfied' scale including 43.4%, (n=23) of 'somewhat satisfied' and 26.4% of 'very satisfied' level (n=14). However, seven of ten in-depth interviewees claim that librarianship undergraduates should possess more knowledge of creating databases, digital resources of repository, and be able to apply ICT to enrich the library marketing products or library services and notifications. This result goes well with the conclusions drawn by Hoang (2011) and L. T. Bui (2013). These authors indicate that training program should focus more on knowledge of creating and managing databases. Hoang (2011) argues that librarianship undergraduates have to apply ICT into work, master the standards of creating databases, organize bibliographies, indexing, metadata, analyse and gather information. Specially, undergraduates should know emerging technologies to apply into library work. LIM undergraduates' foreign language skills were scored from satisfaction and higher points with 96.2%, in which 43.4% (n = 23) was 'satisfied' and 39.6% (n = 21) was 'somewhat satisfied'. Soft skills were also paid much attention by the employers. In particular, 37.7% (n = 20) of the employers were 'very satisfied' with communication skills of LIM undergraduates. In addition, they were quite pleased of LIM undergraduates' group working skills and time management with 43.4% (n=23) and 52.8% (n = 28) respectively. Self-study and improvement capacities of LIM undergraduates were scored at 'somewhat satisfaction' (41.5%; n = 22). In the meanwhile, more than 50% of the employers felt fine with LIM undergraduates' discipline obeying (54.7%; n = 29) and their responsibility (58.5%; n=31). In terms of interview data, 3 of 4 public library leaders state that librarianship undergraduates have poor ability of organizing the book related events. They are not keen on planning and financial setting for the events such as book exhibitions and book reviews. These leaders explain that librarianship undergraduates might assign planning is the leaders' job. Therefore, they paid no attention to the lecturer's instructions in class. With the thought of becoming normal staff rather than library leaders after graduating, they do not care about leadership relating matters. In reality, they are required to make a plan for the library event and as a matter of fact, they cannot fulfill their assignments. Actually, current undergraduates should not ignore the leadership lessons. Lecturers should train them more about how to make a plan and budget for library activities. They should practice and create their own plans as the requirement to complete the leadership courses.

No	Aspects	Very Unsatisfied		Unsatisfied		Satisfied		Somewhat Satisfied		Very Satisfied	
		n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
1.	Library professional knowledge	1	1.8	1	1.8	14	26.5	11	20.8	26	49.1
2.	ICT application knowledge	0	0	0	0	15	28.2	24	45.3	14	26.5
3.	Management knowledge	0	0	2	3.8	26	49.1	19	35.8	6	11.3
4.	Knowledge adapted to your organisation requirement	0	0	2	3.8	16	30.2	29	54.7	6	11.3

Table 1 : Employer Satisfaction on LIM Undergraduates

## 5.2. Employers' Requirements on Knowledge, Capacity and Skills of LIM Undergraduates

Beside library professional knowledge, LIM undergraduates were acquired to possess eight groups of knowledge, capacities and skills. They are communication skills, teamwork skills, and independent study skills, skills of organising and analysing information, skills of providing information, ICT skills, management skills and general knowledge. Evaluation scales are ①Very unnecessary, ②Unnecessary, ③Necessary, ④Somewhat necessary, and ⑤Very necessary. In terms of communication skills, communication and exchange skills were highly evaluated at 66% (n = 35) and 34% (n = 18) at 'necessary' and 'somewhat necessary' (see Table 2). This result is similar to Patache (2016) that soft skills are necessary to graduates at work. There is a difference as public library leader want librarianship undergraduates to train themselves communication skills, team work, active and interacting with users while academic library leaders prefer them to train interviewing skills. It is because some of them do not know how to market themselves to make good impressions on the recruitment committees even though they gained good study scores at school.

Criteria in teamwork skills were equally assessed by public and academic library leaders. In these criteria, problem and confliction solving skills scored at the highest points – 'very necessary' (56.6%; n = 30). Standing at the second position was skills of collaborating and connecting team members and team management skills (planning, organizing, leading and controlling...) both scored at 54.7% (n= 29). This result supports the research conducted by Schomaker (2015) who states that writing skills, communication skills, mathematic skills, research skills, critical thinking, decision making, evaluating, computer skills, teamwork skills and life-long learning are definitely trained in the university. These skills will help undergraduates more flexible at work. Self-study skills for work completion and independent thinking and creative ability at work both reached at 62.3% (n= 33). Criterion of computer skills ranked at 69.8% (n= 37) 'very necessary'. User services were peaked at 'very necessary' (62.3%; n= 33). Document management and archives scored the highest requirements from the employers (52.8%; n = 28). No leader considered it as an unnecessary and very unnecessary skill. However, all of four public library leaders accepted that LIM undergraduates should pay much attention to leadership such as vision, social knowledge, professional, organizational and national development. In particular, LIM undergraduates ought to have innovation, planning, managing and consulting their leaders. In addition, an academic

library leader indicated that LIM undergraduates graduated and worked as much as the staff. In the meanwhile, limited number of them showed up their managerial potential capacities. As a consequence, LIM undergraduates should be trained about leadership and management to be ready for managerial positions in the future. In general knowledge, library marketing and scientific research knowledge were highly paid attention with 45.3% (at 'very necessary' level) and 35.8% (at 'necessary' level).

No	Aspects	Very Unnecessary		Unnecessary		Necessary		Somewhat Necessary		Very Necessary	
		n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
1.	Communication skills and exchange skills	0	0	0	0	5	9.4	13	24.5	35	66
2.1	Teamwork skills (Problem and confliction solving)	0	0	0	0	11	20.8	12	22.6	30	56.6
2.2	Teamwork skills (Collaborating and connecting team members)	0	0	0	0	9	17	15	28.3	29	54.7
2.3	Teamwork skills (Team management)	0	0	0	0	7	13.2	17	32.1	29	54.7
3.	Independent study skills		0	2	3.8	26	49.1	19	35.8	6	11.3
4.	Skills of organising and analysing information		0	2	3.8	16	30.2	29	54.7	6	11.3
5.	Skills of providing information	0	0	3	5.7	6	11.3	11	20.8	33	62.3
6.	ICT skills	0	0	0	0	8	15.1	8	15.1	37	69.8
7.	Management skills	0	0	0	0	13	24.5	12	22.6	28	52.8
8.1	General knowledge (Marketing)	1	1.9	2	3.8	16	30.2	10	18.9	24	45.3
8.2	General knowledge (Scientific research)	0	0	2	3.8	19	35.8	14	26.4	18	34

Table 2: Employer Requirements on LIM Undergraduates

## 6. Conclusion

The findings from online and interview data show that LIM undergraduates are well assessed by employers. However, library leaders expect/ need current students and graduates to keep on training themselves about ICT, management, leadership and social knowledge. In particular, it is important that students have to establish networks for their job development, further training on foreign languages, communication and soft skills. Moreover, their behaviour and collaboration at their workplaces need to be considered and consolidated to increase the number of library users. Specifically, they should be trained or involved in research knowledge so as to help library researchers conduct their work.

This current research provides an important source of evidence for evaluating the training outputs of the LIM program from stakeholders including employers. In addition to previous studies related to the discipline and LIM students, the research contributes to updating and refining the existing curriculum in order to train the knowledgeable staff of specialized ability and skills to meet the needs of the society. Research helps to improve the quality of education and reputation of the university, contributing to the training of high quality human resources for the society.

## 7. References

- i. Bui, P.H. (2013). What professional skills are the employers looking for from library undergraduates? *Journal of Information and Documentation*, 5, 22-29.
- ii. Bui, P.H. (2016). 4C Model to train librarians. *Vietnam Library Journal*, 2(58), 26-32.
- iii. Bui, L. T. (2013). Looking for solutions to train professional skills for library undergraduates to meet the employers' needs. *Vietnam Library Journal*, 3(41), 36-38.
- iv. Bui, T. T. (2011). Soft skills for library undergraduates. Paper presented at the Library training process, Ha Noi, Vietnam.
- v. Hoang, T. T. H. (2011). Necessary capacities of the librarians - the employers' viewpoint. Paper presented at the 50 years of library - information training program, Ha Noi, Vietnam.
- vi. IFLA. (2011). Hướng dẫn về chương trình giáo dục nghề thư viện / thông tin = Guidelines for professional library/ information educational programmes. *Tạp chí Thư viện Việt Nam*, 3(29), 38-41.
- vii. Krejcie, R. V., & Morgan, D. W. (1970). Determining sample size for research activities. *Educational and Psychological Measurement*, 30, 607-610.

- viii. Kupfer, A. (2011). Towards a theoretical framework for the comparative understanding of globalisation, higher education, the labour market and inequality. *Journal of Education and Work*, 24(1-2), 185-208. doi: 10.1080/13639080.2010.534345
- ix. Livanos, I., & Nuñez, I. (2016). Better safe than sorry? The role of stratification and quality of higher education in the labour market outcomes of graduates across Europe. *Economic and Industrial Democracy*, 37(2), 345-372. doi: 10.1177/0143831X14547117
- x. Nguyen, M.H. (2017). Can Tho University LIM alumni's jobs and correlations between job ratio and study process. *Vietnam Library Journal*, 4(66), 49-52.
- xi. Nguyen, M. H. (2012). Sharing experiences on teaching methods of library educational program. *Library and Information Technology*, 8, 1-3.
- xii. Nguyen, T. H. (2013). Human resources training for libraries in the information society and knowledge economy. *Cultural Study Journal*, 6. <http://huc.edu.vn/vi/spct/id167/DAO-TAO-NGUON-NHAN-LUC-THU-VIEN---THONG-TIN-TRONG-BOI-CANH-XA-HOI-THONG-TIN-VA-NEN-KINH-TE-TRI-THUC/>
- xiii. Nguyen, T. N. (2016). Requirements on current librarians and responsibilities of the training institutes. Retrieved Nov. 23, 2016, from <http://flis.huc.edu.vn/?p=1695>
- xiv. Nguyen, T. T. (2012). General evaluation on human resources of library and information settings at academic libraries in Hanoi. *Vietnam Library Journal*, 5(37), 28-32.
- xv. Palade, A., & Constantin, C. (2013). Graduates' integration on the labour market. *Bulletin of the Transilvania University of Brasov. Economic Sciences. Series V*, 6(2), 65-74.
- xvi. Patache, L. (2016). Insertion of Romanian higher education graduates in the labour market: Limitations and challenges. *Economics, Management and Financial Markets*, 11(1), 126-134.
- xvii. Pavlin, S. (2014). The role of higher education in supporting graduates' early labour market careers. *International Journal of Manpower*, 35(4), 576-576.
- xviii. Schomaker, R. (2015). Accreditation and quality assurance in the Egyptian higher education system. *Quality Assurance in Education*, 23(2), 149-165. doi: 10.1108/QAE-08-2013-0034
- xix. Tao, T. T. M. (2010). Some solutions to upgrade the quality of library educational training at Political Institute in Thanh Hoa Province. *Vietnam Library Journal*, 6(26), 28-32.
- xx. Vu, T. N. (2011). Library educational training based on requirements of labour markets. <http://dlib.huc.edu.vn/bitstream/123456789/25/3/%C4%90%C3%80%20T%E1%BA%A0%20C%C3%81N%20B%E1%BB%98%20TH%C3%94NG%20TIN%20TH%C6%AF%20VI%E1%BB%86N%20.pdf>
- xxi. Yonezawa, A. (2002). The quality assurance system and market forces in Japanese higher education. *The International Journal of Higher Education and Educational Planning*, 43(1), 127-139. doi: 10.1023/A:1012988721975
- xxii. Yoshimoto, K. (2000). Comparison between Japan and Europe concerning the transition from higher education to work. Paper presented at the the International Industrial Relations Association's 12th World Congress, Tokyo, Japan.