

# THE INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF HUMANITIES & SOCIAL STUDIES

## The Emergent Situation of Human Trafficking in Southeast Asia: A Case Study of Vietnam

Dr. Nguyen Huy Binh

Senior Lecturer, Faculty of Criminal Investigation on Hot Traces,  
The People's Police Academy, Vietnam

### **Abstract:**

Vietnam is recorded as one of the transnational hubs of the Southeast Asian region in terms of human trafficking, particularly with women and children. In recent years, several cases are trafficking in persons in and through Vietnam towards their shared neighbours' countries, including Cambodia, China, and Laos, and beyond at third countries in the world. Although the Government of Vietnam recognized this new situation of human trafficking in domestic and regional scale and also deployed many programs to control, the effectiveness of these activities has been still limited. Within the scope of the paper, this study provides the general context of trafficking in persons in Vietnam with its specific characteristics in terms of both offenders and their related victims. Also, the current trends and patterns of human trafficking in Vietnam in comparison to the regional situation are also assessed and analyzed. There are main reasons to explain why these trends occur and exist in Vietnam as well as make clear some fundamental barriers to prevent and combat human trafficking at the current time. The paper also calls for practical recommendations to improve the effectiveness of preventing and fighting to traffic in persons in Vietnam in the future.

**Keywords:** Human Trafficking, Victims; Modus Operandi, Law Enforcement Agencies (LEAs), Crime Prevention, ASEAN Vietnam

### **1. Introduction**

The situation of human trafficking in the world and the region continues to be complicated, especially in human trafficking through illegal migrants from Europe, Africa and the Middle East to Europe. According to the Global Report on Trafficking in Persons of UNODC (2018), there are about 244 million migrants worldwide and continue to increase due to the effects of terrorism, conflict, violence and many of them become victims. They are also concerns that there are nearly 10,000 illegal organ transplants each year involving human trafficking organizations (Campell & Davison, 2012; UNODC, 2016, 2018). Notably, the Mekong sub-region (including Vietnam) is considered to be the hot spot of illegal human trafficking and migration, estimated profit from human trafficking in the region to achieve tens of billions of dollars a year (Department of State, 2018). In this paper, an overall picture of the current concerns in human trafficking in Vietnam will be provided as one of the priorities to assist in understanding this situation. Besides that, many analyses relating to trends and patterns of trafficking in persons in Vietnam, both domestic and international markets, also share and discuss before looking for causes and barriers of these traffickers in the reality of Vietnam's context. The issue of human trafficking in Vietnam is as complex as other countries in regions and global. Indeed, Vietnam bears witness to a wide range of patterns of trafficking, which in part reflects the prominent features of geography, history, and economy of this nation. The flexibility of methods of traffickers involves in these routes has resulted in many challenges when it comes to addressing this crime.

### **2. The Current Situation: Alarming Concerns with Numerous Risks**

The literature on human trafficking in Vietnam has shown that Vietnam has experienced both the domestic and cross-border smuggling of humans for a broad range of purposes. The majority of studies focus on the trafficking of women and children for sexual exploitation, mainly prostitution (Huong, 2015; Phuong, 2015). Recently, however, the traffic of men and trafficking for labour exploitation have received more considerable attention in some reports, although it has been argued that these issues need to be explored more comprehensively in a Vietnamese context (MOLISA, 2018; MPS, 2018b).

In recent years, the authorities have received more than one thousand reports, denouncing criminals involved in human trafficking. The police investigation agency prosecuted 1,021 cases, with 2,035 accused, accounting for 97.3% of the stories and accusations received and processed (MPS, 2018a). The crime of trafficking in people mainly exists in the hidden form, so right from the discovery, denouncing criminals has been very difficult, even when there are denunciations and reports about criminals, the verification and investigation also not comfortable. A number of reasons to prove this dilemma, amongst is most cases, and cases of trafficking abroad occur long before being detected, the victims and victims abroad cannot verify; less evidence, mainly based on testimony, denunciations of harm or family members (Hoang, 2017; Hoang et al., 2018; Nhien, 2016). Therefore, prevention of trafficking has been difficult.

According to statistics, the situation of human trafficking occurs both in the domestic market through selling in restaurants, karaoke bars, disguised coffee, massage and abroad through sexual exploitation and forced labour (MPS, 2018a). The crime of trafficking in persons occurs within 63 provinces and cities nationwide in Vietnam. According to a report by the Ministry of Public Security, for five years (2012-2017), there are more than 3,000 victims of trafficking and suspicion of being trafficked, of which 90% of victims were sold to China (MPS, 2018a). The number of trafficked and suspected victims of trafficking is 3,090 people, of which, mainly women and children (accounting for over 90%), most of them are ethnic minorities (accounting for over 80%), often concentrated in rural and mountainous areas, especially in remote and isolated areas, most in challenging economic conditions (MPS, 2018a). Most victims are women, when tricked into selling abroad, forced married as the local people's wife and sexually exploited and forced labour (Hoang et al., 2018; MPS, 2018a; Stockl, Kiss, Hoehler, Dung, & Zimmerman, 2017). Among more than 3,000 victims of trafficking have been discovered, the number of victims returned was 2,571, of which, the number of victims returned and rescued was 1,334 people, the number of self-returning victims was 1,237 in which the number of victims who have not responded is 519 (MPS, 2018a). In particular, in Can Tho City, the Police Department discovered 8 cases of male victims who were tricked into selling kidneys to China. From 2012 to 2017, investigating agencies have prosecuted 1,021 cases, 2,035 accused, accounting for over 97% of the reports and denunciations received and processed (MPS, 2018a).

### *2.1. Domestic Market*

In Vietnam, internal trafficking is inextricably linked to the rural-urban movements. Indeed, the majority of victims are women and children trafficked mainly for sexual services, to big cities, including Hanoi, Ho Chi Minh City, Quang Ninh, Hue, Da Nang, Khanh Hoa, Ba Ria-Vung Tau, Hai Phong and Da Lat (MOLISA, 2018; MPS, 2018b). These places are significant destinations for domestic trafficking in which sex work appears prevalent. In addition, much research has mentioned that children and men are also subjected to domestic trafficking for labour exploitation in agriculture and construction, as well as begging, selling lottery tickets, polishing shoes in big cities, and working in brick kilns, factories and gold mines (Hoang, 2017; Hoang et al., 2018; Nhien, 2016). To a lesser extent, Vietnamese children are further targeted for child sex tourism; meanwhile, babies are also the subject of internal trafficking for adoption due to loopholes in the legal system (UNODC, 2014; VACR & ECAPT, 2018).

### *2.2. International and Regional Market*

Internationally, Vietnam is predominantly a source country for trafficked people for sexual exploitation; men and boys for labour exploitation; and women for forced marriage; children for illegal adoption, forced labour, sex tourism, and organ removal. Although the Vietnamese victims are destined for countries within the Greater Mekong Sub-region (GMS), Western Europe, Africa, and the Middle East, China and Cambodia remain the most prevalent destinations that reflect features of the unique geography of these countries, as well as the culture, language, and economy they share with Vietnam.

#### 2.2.1. Vietnam-China

The Vietnam-to-China route is recognized as the main route with 70 percent of victims being trafficked along with it. While, research indicates that most of the women and children trafficked to China are intended for prostitution or other sex services, trafficking for marriage also occurs because some southern provinces of China have a severe female deficit (Nhien, 2016; Stockl et al., 2017). The reason is that China is implementing many mechanisms to promote border economic development, building infrastructure in the opposite border area, encouraging people to move to reside near the border, entailing social evils that are difficult to control, generate more people to participate and attract people to hired labour (Ngoc, 2019; Stockl et al., 2017). China still has a lot of customs and policy to lead a gender imbalance as well as the rate of male disparity is higher than female, especially the number of men of marriage age is not possible getting married in the country, wishing to marry Vietnamese women (Nhien, 2016; Phuong, 2015). In other words, buying and trading people who are adopting children, marrying foreigners, to hire, donating organs are unavoidable trends (MPS, 2018a).

It is believed that traffickers use unofficial paths and border gates in the northern provinces of Vietnam to transport women to commonplace destinations in China such as Bang Tuong, Dong Hung, Quang Xi, Ha Khau, and Nam Ninh, and even farther to Hebei, Jiangsu or Guangdong (Nhien, 2016; Stockl et al., 2017). Also, this route has experienced the phenomenon of trafficking of Vietnamese men from minority ethnic groups for forced labour in mines and brick factories in China. Vietnamese children (particularly boys) are also trafficked to China for adoption (Nhien, 2016; Stockl et al., 2017). Boys are favoured here because of the demand for male babies in the agriculture sector of China, and the market for Chinese couples who have a girl and cannot have a second child due to China's 'one child' policy (Hoang et al., 2018; Nhien, 2016; Stockl et al., 2017). It is believed that child trafficking is a very profitable enterprise.

#### 2.2.2. Vietnam-Cambodia

The border between Vietnam and Cambodia accounts for about 11% of the total cases (MPS, 2018a). Indeed, about one quarter to one-third of all sex workers in Cambodia originated from Vietnam. Victims of this route are mainly Southern provinces and go through shared borderland's regions. Traveling along the southwestern side of Vietnam, Cambodia is reported to be another significant destination country for the trafficking of Vietnamese people predominantly coming from the southern provinces of Vietnam such as An Giang, Tay Ninh and Dong Thap province (Kneebone & Debeljak, 2010). The majority of women and girls are trafficked here for prostitution because the Cambodian communities find Vietnamese women beautiful and diligent (Hoang, Thanh, & Anh, 2015; Tuan & Thanh, 2013). Traffickers use debt

bondage to control these women. While children are trafficked for begging, men are trafficked to work in construction, factories, or plantations because Cambodia does not claim to need skilled laborers like other countries (ECPAT, 2016). Additionally, it has been suggested that some Vietnamese women have recently been trafficked for forced surrogacy in Cambodia.

### 2.2.3. Vietnam and Beyond

Vietnamese victims are also sent to Southeast Asian countries. This route mainly involves the trafficking of women and girls for prostitution, and its main destinations include Thailand, Malaysia and Singapore (Beadle & Davison, 2019; Hoang et al., 2018). As with the route to Cambodia, it has been suggested that the trafficking of Vietnamese women for forced surrogacy services in Thailand, although this has not yet been explored comprehensively (Huong, 2015; Phuong, 2015). Some Vietnamese women are subjected to trafficking for marriage in Singapore and Malaysia via brokerage, whether legal or illegal; meanwhile, others are deceived by fraudulent labour chances in Laos where they end up in exploitative conditions (Anh, 2014; Huong, 2015). These forms of trafficking are also in need of further research to depict the whole picture accurately.

In addition, Vietnamese people are additionally transferred beyond the Southeast Asian countries to locations such as East Asia, the Middle East, North Africa and particularly at Europe (Beadle & Davison, 2019). Here, it is believed that women and children are mostly sold into the sex industry in Taiwan, Macau, Hong Kong, and Russia, or even in as far as African countries like Ghana. It is worth noting that these people are often trafficked via other countries - such as Thailand or Malaysia - before ending up in the sex trade of different countries and regions worldwide. Indeed, this observation accords with the situation facing women trafficked into Taiwan, Hong Kong, Macau, and South Korea for marriage via brokerage whether legal or not (Anh, 2014; Huong, 2015; Tuan & Thanh, 2013). These women are misled by fraudulent economic opportunities from brokers or future foreigner husbands who instead take them to brothels or sell them to other men after they arrive at these destinations legally (MPS, 2016; Viet Nam News, 2016). Indeed, these individuals are often not only forced to work in manufacturing or on farms, but also in domestic servitude to their husbands and his family members who supervise their daily contact and travel (Hoang, 2017; Nhien, 2016).

### **3. The Main Characteristic of Human Trafficking: Offenders and Its Related Victims**

Based on the recent statistic of LEAs of MPS (2018a), offenders in human trafficking are diverse in terms of social composition; offenders can be of different ages, backgrounds, occupations, social status, education level. In particular, persons who commit crimes of trafficking in people of most ages, the number of people aged over 30 is the majority. Almost are socially knowledgeable and socially knowledgeable people and are usually people of border areas border gates and small-scale roads and understand the customs and habits of the people. Besides that, many of them bear convictions and precursors of acts of harbouring, organizing or brooding prostitution; those who have a relationship with a prostitute, business or broker of sex in the country or abroad; those who often travel to both sides of the border to work as hired labour or trade, travel have conditions to contact establishments that want to recruit prostitutes, use illegal energy or brokerage for and receive adopted child (Hoang et al., 2018; Ngoc, 2019; Nhien, 2016; Stockl et al., 2017). In other words, criminal subjects are Vietnamese people who are very diverse such as professional hoodlums, people with criminal records, precedents, collusion with foreigners who are in remote areas and border areas to form a closed line to pull, hook abroad to sell (Hoang et al., 2018; Ngoc, 2019). In some exceptional cases, the offender has also been victims of being sold to China as prostitutes or illegally married, then return to Vietnam to revisit relatives and conspire with other people to trick victims into selling to China in particular (Blue Dragon, 2018; MPS, 2018a).

In recent times, particularly, the offenders are foreigners increasing, mainly Chinese (Hoang et al., 2018; MPS, 2018a). These people took advantage of Vietnam's open-door policy, through forms of tourism, joint ventures and business links to deceive women and children in the way of sending them to work abroad (Hoang, 2017; Hoang et al., 2018). Those offenders are mainly hoodlums, have criminal records and convictions on trafficking in people, cooperation with people in remote mountains and border areas forming closed lines to entice and deceive victims to sell abroad in China.

The primary victims of buying and selling people are women and children, accounting for over 90%, in which many of these victims belong to ethnic minorities, with more than 80% (Blue Dragon, 2018; MPS, 2018a). Victims of human trafficking are often primarily sex slaves, forced labour, organ harvesting, foetuses, hiring children. Victims are not just women and children like the previous years, but the subjects of this type of crime are aimed at both men and babies (Blue Dragon, 2018; MOLISA, 2018; MPS, 2018a).

Victims are often concentrated in rural areas, especially in remote areas. Most of them have severe economic conditions, only work in the fields or have no jobs and have low education levels (Hoang et al., 2015; Phuong, 2013). Also, the victims still lack knowledge about society and life skills, psychological lightness. Victims are women who are sold abroad; most of them are forced to marry as married and sexually exploited, accounts for nearly 80% (Blue Dragon, 2018; MPS, 2018a). Notably, many of these people were victims of trafficking in China, returning to Vietnam to visit relatives or flee to cooperate with other people to trick the victims (MOLISA, 2018; MPS, 2018b). Not to mention, some people also pretended to be police and border guards through Zalo network, Facebook to make friends and acquaint women then cheated to sell to China.

#### 4. Modus Operandi in Human Trafficking: A Diverse Profile

According to anti-human trafficking authorities, the situation of human trafficking in border areas is complicated and tends to increase (MPS, 2018a). In fact, modus operandi of traffickers is increasingly sophisticated and complex. Accordingly, criminal subjects often take advantage of complicated family and economic circumstances, limited awareness of some women and children to seduce and deceive, then buy and sell abroad (MOLISA, 2018; MPS, 2018b). The victims were sold elsewhere for various purposes such as sexual exploitation, illegal marriage and even exploitation of labour (MOLISA, 2018; MPS, 2018b).

##### 4.1. Preparation (Be Targeted on Victims)

According to LEAs, in most cases, offenders often go to distress multiply to ensure that the victim is present at the right time, in the right place to meet and communicate with the buyer. In many cases, offenders and victims cross the border by passing through the border gates with legitimate entry and exit papers; In case of not going through the border gate, they often have secretly secret acts and are carefully calculated about the time and place of crossing the border to avoid the patrol force of the functional force. Offenders can tell the victim in advance about how to report when on the way to meet the inspection and control of LEAs. In the case of personal transportation such as cars, ships or boats, offenders may hide victims in enclosed places in those vehicles.

##### 4.2. Forms of Meeting

The teams of traffickers used the following tricks to make friend and seduce victims to move via cars, trains, and airplanes. To avoid LEA's monitor, in the process of transporting, traffickers often brought victim in vehicle after giving sleeping pills or anaesthetic drugs put into sealed cars, even put in a container for transportation (MOLISA, 2018; MPS, 2018b). In some cases, they let the victim go on a straight path (MPS, 2018a). Sellers and buyers often have direct contact with each other at pre-appointment locations to exchange victims in which, these connections may take place in front of the victim or not, so the victim can know all of them (MPS, 2018a). A standard method of payment is that the buyer pays cash directly to the seller or to the intermediary who is responsible for transporting the victim (MPS, 2016, 2018a). In some places, the subjects go to the high market, school gates, get acquainted with women, students ask for phone numbers, make friends through Zalo, Facebook pretends to love to invite traveling, tricking girls entering restaurants, karaoke bars, massage in tourist areas, industrial parks to organize prostitution or forced labour (MPS, 2018a).

##### 4.3. Information Agreements

Direct transfer between sellers and buyers (or possibly through intermediaries) is quick. Most are places where prostitution is organized or facilities of brokers for those wishing to buy wives and servants (Hoang, 2017; Nhien, 2016). In case of purchasing to exploit labour, the receiving site will be provided facilities and accommodations. According to anti-human trafficking agency of MPS (2018a) traffickers were organized and operated by various inter-provincial and transnational lines and gangs with sophisticated and cunning tricks and tricks. They take advantage of the loose management of families and schools and through social networking sites such as Zalo, Facebook, Viber to invite, pretend to be lovers, entice to travel, work as high-income employees, labour export at a cost low before trading them as victims of forced prostitution and forced labour (Hoang, 2017; Hoang et al., 2018; Ngoc, 2019; Nhien, 2016). Besides that, taking advantage of marriage brokerage or setting up disguised marriage brokers, traffickers get acquainted with the bond of brothers, father, son or pretend to love to cheat with those potential victims to seduce to go (Nhien, 2016; Phuong, 2015).

##### 4.4. Transfer to Final Destinations

Subjects implementing acts of human trafficking are concealed by such forms as sightseeing, tourism, signing economic contracts, exporting labour, organizing marriage through brokers, adoption. Female victims are often sold into prostitution to sexual exploitation (Hoang, 2017; Hoang et al., 2018; Ngoc, 2019; Nhien, 2016). A few were sold to make wives; meanwhile, many were sold to labor-exploited production facilities and besides, a few are sold for adoption and even, some cases are removed organs for sale (MOLISA, 2018; MPS, 2018b). In recent times, the abduction and appropriation of women and children brought to China are also complicated in the northern mountainous border provinces such as Ha Giang and Lao Cai. In particular, recently, some women have been discovered. H'Mong ethnic women in Dien Bien go to China to get married and join with some people who are Mong ethnic people in Lai Chau, Dien Bien, Thanh Hoa, taking advantage of kinship relations to cross the border to Hua Phan and Phong Sa Ly (Laos) to trick H'Mong women (Laos) into China to sell into illegal prostitution or marriage (MOLISA, 2018; MPS, 2018b). Some dangerous objects pretended to be police and border guards on social networks to make friends with women, promising, then cheating on selling to China.

#### 5. Causes of Human Trafficking in Vietnam and Practical Difficulties to Solve

##### 5.1. The Main Causes of Human Trafficking: A Various Issues

To have an overview of the situation of trafficking in Vietnam, we need to have an assessment of the causes of this crime situation.

Firstly, in terms of geographical location, Vietnam has a land border area spanning 25 provinces with more than 4,000 km, adjacent to three countries of Laos, Cambodia and China, many trails, small channels, and cross-roads, especially the Vietnam-China border (Ngoc, 2019; Nhien, 2016). There is bearing the boldness of the long-standing ethnic and ethnic

relations among those local minorities' groups (Stockl et al., 2017). Alongside with natural and socio-economic factors, the specific geographical with several mountain and river that are very convenient benefiting people from both sides of the border to exchange and trade and visit relatives (Nhien, 2016; Phuong, 2015). Also, Vietnam has an unfavourable road, sea and road system for immigration. Therefore, human trafficking activities to neighbouring countries, with borders with Vietnam tend to increase, objects of use using sophisticated tricks to cover the eyes of authorities to bring victims across the border (MOLISA, 2018; MPS, 2018b).

Secondly, regarding the booming of social networks, it contributes to making modes and tricks of human trafficking crimes more and more sophisticated, cunning, and organized (MPS, 2018a). A number of popular applications on the Internet such as Facebook and Zalo were permitted close cooperation between buyers and sellers, brokers, leads lead, form inter-provincial, and transnational crime lines (Hoang et al., 2018; Ngoc, 2019; Nhien, 2016). Unlike in the past, access to and familiarization with victims had to meet directly to fly, so now, more and more people commit crimes through social networking sites and smart phones to reach victims (Hoang, 2017; Ngoc, 2019). To minimize and minimize direct contact with victims, the prevention, detection and struggle to prevent the functional forces face many difficulties.

Thirdly, with respect of socio-economic disparity, currently, the socio-economic gap between urban and rural areas as well as between plain and the mountainous regions are also one of the most reasons to lead the current situation of selling people (Hoang et al., 2018; Ngoc, 2019; Nhien, 2016). The majority of human trafficking cases take place in mountainous, remote, remote and underdeveloped regions, with many difficulties in roads and vehicles (Ngoc, 2019; Nhien, 2016). The occupation of victims before being cheated to sell abroad is mainly farming and unemployment, their lives do not have enough social information (Hoang, 2017; Ngoc, 2019). Therefore, they are easily exploited and believe in criminals, becoming victims of trafficking crimes.

## *5.2. Some Difficulties and Problems to Deal with Human Trafficking*

### 5.2.1. Challenges to Identify and Utilize Evidence to Prove Cases of Human Trafficking

Human trafficking is a kind of hidden crime, difficult to detect and handle in the process of the criminal investigation. In recent meeting of National Committee on Prevention and Combat Human Trafficking in Vietnam, Chairman of Judicial Committee Le Thi Nga stated that, over time, the situation of trafficking in criminals continues to have a tendency complex, not only in the mountainous, remote, border and border provinces but also spread across the country, potentially threatening security, social order, and safety (MPS, 2018a). The Law on Human Trafficking Prevention and Control passed by the National Assembly, and effective from 1<sup>st</sup> January 2012, has provided an essential legal framework as a basis for the prevention, detection, and handling of trafficking in persons. However, in the process of implementing the Law, besides the achieved results, there are still limitations and shortcomings. According to Deputy Minister of Public Security Le Quy Vuong, in recent years, the authorities have received more than one thousand reports, denouncing criminals involved in human trafficking (MPS, 2018a). The police investigation agency prosecuted 1,021 cases, with 2,035 accused, accounting for 97.3% of the reports and denunciations received and processed (MPS, 2018a). Crime of trafficking in people mainly exists in the hidden form, so right from the discovery, denouncing criminals has been very difficult, even when there are denunciations and reports about criminals, the verification and investigation also not easy, because most cases and cases of trafficking abroad occur long before being detected, the victims and victims abroad cannot verify (MPS, 2018a).

Regarding the role of witness in human trafficking cases, from the fact of directing and investigating urgent cases, finding and conducting witness testimony is a significant issue. The majority of witnesses when asked about criminal acts of organized, rogue criminals often have a shy, fearful attitude, fear of retaliation (Liberty Asia & Blue Dragon, 2018). Many cases, they often refuse to report or report insufficiently, not precisely what they know. Therefore, it is required to conduct witness testimony to grasp the psychology of witnesses, have the aptitude and persuasion ability to educate them. Individual cases for important witnesses may arrange to bring witnesses to a safe place with a guard to encourage them, to convince them to provide documents related to the case, to protect tight and secure them (MOLISA, 2018; MPS, 2018b). Therefore, for cases that do not fall into the case of misconduct, only when the victim escapes to the locality and has an accusation, the offender will be discovered exclusively rely on the victim's testimony as well as the confession of the offender.

### 5.2.2. Challenging to Implement and Support for Victims of Human Trafficking

Currently, the work of receiving and supporting victims has many challenges in the mechanism's policy. Of the nearly 7,500 victims mentioned above, only half were verified and supported by the provisions of the Human Trafficking Law (MPS, 2018a). The number of supported victims accounts for a small proportion of the number of victims returning in reality (Liberty Asia & Blue Dragon, 2018). Many victims recover, who do not go through the receiving procedure, did not enough grounds to verify that the victim has been bought or sold and thus, they were not entitled to receive support regimes (Liberty Asia & Blue Dragon, 2018; Ngoc, 2019). Besides that, regarding some women's victims locates at rural areas with severe economic conditions, few skills or young girls, they want to marry rich foreign husbands from China's side. Paradoxically, the number of people who have not returned is mainly in China, LEAs cannot bring forces to rescue without their specific address in Vietnam (MPS, 2018a). Furthermore, in many cases, in the localities, the support for victims has been assigned to the labour, invalids and social sectors. Due to limited resources, the ability to provide services is not ready, the support needs of victims have not been met (MPS, 2018a, 2018b).

Additionally, in term of the legal mechanism to support victims of trafficking, it is still some slow shortcomings. Expressly, the Human Trafficking Law does not stipulate the exclusion of administrative responsibility for victims of trafficking so they can even be administratively sanctioned in some cases (Liberty Asia & Blue Dragon, 2018). For example, in terms of unidentifiable document of victims, who most are bearing fake documents for entry and exit in the process of trafficking, the barriers to permit them reintegrate into the community made them feel scared and discriminated against (Hoang, 2017; Hoang et al., 2018).

Indeed, the current law only regulates trafficked victims to receive psychological and medical support during their stay at a social protection facility, victim support facility (Liberty Asia & Blue Dragon, 2018). Otherwise, the victims do not have psychological and medical assistance, although many of them are in great need. Some current spending levels for direct assistance to victims are now too low, making the facility perform very hard. According to the Joint Circular No.134/2013 of the Ministry of Finance - Ministry of Labour, War Invalids and Social Affairs (hereinafter Circular 134), victims of buying and selling people are supported VND 30,000 per day (around US\$1,5) for meals at sponsorship facility, up to 60 days as well VND 50,000 per person (around US\$2,5) for medical examination and treatment. It is impossible to act in reality, in which most of the victims return with many serious diseases, the actual medical examination and treatment costs are much higher (Hoang et al., 2018).

## **6. Practical Recommendation to Improve the Effectiveness of Prevention and Control Human Trafficking in Vietnam**

Currently, the situation of human trafficking crimes has many complicated developments, requiring the participation of the whole political system to offer drastic measures to fight against this type of dangerous criminals. To prevent and repel the situation of trafficking, the author suggests some basic recommendations and practical ideas to apply follow as:

### *6.1. Improve Context and Method in Propaganda to Prevent Human Trafficking*

It is necessary to renew education and communication on human trafficking crimes with rich contents and forms to raise public awareness about human trafficking crimes. Indeed, focusing on disseminating deeply to high-risk people, places where women use a lot of women, many women marry foreigners, girls who are not good, have particular circumstances instead let them return victims of trafficking crimes. In particular, focus on the propagation, dissemination, and education of new legal provisions on trafficking in people under 16 years of the Criminal Code 2015 (amended in 2017) in the society, particularly at vulnerable locations crossing borderland shared areas between Vietnam and Cambodia, China and Laos.

The local authorities should direct request relevant departments and unions to promote propaganda, timely dissemination of legal policies, methods of operation of criminals trafficking in people. In which, they should design and structure various programs to share good experiences, preventive measures, struggle results, advanced examples, effective models for prevention and combat of human trafficking crimes through publishing on newspapers and television. Furthermore, they should maintain legal answers, readers' mailboxes, and provide free legal advice through telephone number 1088. Local Women's Union should promote propaganda and education on extensive and in-depth prevention of trafficking. The authorities in LEAs need to organize the propaganda sessions on prevention and control of social evils; prevention and combat of human trafficking at schools for officials, teachers, parents, students, and people. Organize training courses, improve capacity for staff working in victim support at the grassroots level.

The Border Guard Command of the localities should direct the border guard stations and stations to organize propaganda to prevent and combat human trafficking. Units need to coordinate with the commune, ward and township Women's Union to send officials to the ports, boats and clusters of safe ships and boats on rivers and bays to propagate the operation methods and tricks of human trafficking in order to raise the awareness of the people, thereby helping them to recognize the conspiracies and skills of the subjects and actively participate in denouncing and fighting human trafficking. The Ministry of Public Security through professional task force to anti-human trafficking's branches should take the initiative in synchronously implementing professional measures, firmly grasping the situation, especially at critical routes and areas of human trafficking; review, statistics focal points, lines of suspicion of social trafficking activities to focus on verifying, collecting documents, establishing a particular case to fight for destruction. At the same time, closely coordinate with the Border Guard Command of localities and functional forces in patrolling, controlling and exchanging information on lines, questionable points, tapes, criminal gangs trafficking people and victims of trafficking to conduct the collection of collected documents and evidence, setting up specialties, fighting to arrest objects and rescue trafficked victims. Besides that, border guards need to coordinate with functional forces to implement comprehensively with contents such as exchange of information on the situation, coordination of the implementation of professional tasks, in which pay attention to mobilizing public participation. Prevention and fight against crimes of human trafficking; coordinate the implementation of professional plans; proactively setting up struggling projects and cases; coordinate in verifying and arresting criminals hiding in border areas.

### *6.2. Deploy and Apply the Model of Safe Migrant Youth Club*

Model safe migrant youth club contributes to reducing human trafficking by improving the capacity of young people to protect themselves and their peers. Clubs should be established at the village level for young people aged 12 to 17 years. Since then, helping young people improve their knowledge related to the dangers of human trafficking, laws about trafficking prevention and prevention and learn specific steps to protect themselves as a network Support grid,

know the contact number of the hotline. At the same time, teenagers learn skills to develop their adaptability, skills that focus on developing both internal strength and external support systems, soft copy protection skills Dear.

### *6.3. Improving the Effectiveness of Receiving and Supporting Victims and Implementing Policies and Laws*

The Ministry of Public Security should closely coordinate with the Ministry of Labour, War Invalids and Social Affairs in promptly verifying and identifying returned victims from foreign countries to quickly receive, support and create conditions. Best for victims of early integration with the community. Additionally, the Vietnam Women's Union needs to develop employment introduction programs, support women victims, help them with jobs and stable incomes; There are support centres and procedures to provide household registration for women who have been trafficked in border areas, to support their children who are children of the victims to go to school. The Ministry of Public Security should coordinate with the Ministry of Justice to verify cases of filing foreign marriage registration dossiers and adoption registration with external elements.

### *6.4. Improve the Quality of Illiteracy Eradication and Education Universalization*

Local authorities, especially those in difficult and remote areas need to do well in eradicating illiteracy and universalizing education for those who are at risk of becoming victims of offenses. Women and children so that they can access information from the media to protect themselves. It is necessary to include education for women and children in primary and secondary school, providing them with preventive methods in a complex social environment, giving them a "mechanism defence" from a young age.

### *6.5. Strengthening International Cooperation*

Local police should closely coordinate with the Department of Foreign Affairs - Ministry of Public Security to verify and look up information on related subjects of foreign trade lines, as well as in the process of rescue victims. The internal forces should coordinate with the functional effects of the countries bordering on the border, working closely with the Border Agency of the countries in training to improve border inspection and control capacity; building and managing immigration data through border gates.

The Ministry of Public Security and the Border Guard Department of Narcotics and Crime should coordinate with U.N. organizations and non-governmental organizations such as UNODC, UNICEF, UNIAP, IOM in the next framework. International cooperation plan in drug prevention and control, prevention of human trafficking of Steering Committee 138/CP. To improve the level of international Law, specific operations on human trafficking control and the capacity to fight crime prevention and upgrading, contributing to improving the effectiveness of prevention and combat of trafficking. People on border lines. Recognizing the dangers of this kind of activity, as well as the need to cooperate at international levels for the prevention and combat of human trafficking, the international community has made general agreements through public documents. To create a legal basis for controlling these criminal acts.

## **7. Conclusions**

To prevent and combat effectively to human trafficking, in recent years, the Government of Vietnam has been continuing to request all ministries, branches, and localities at all level, from headquartered, provincial to the district, to implement earnestly and apply comprehensively many strategies, programs and methods. Accordingly, these agencies had advised the party committees, authorities to organize and thoroughly plans to implement highly effective implementation of documents issued by the National Assembly, the Government, the Prime Minister concerning prevention and control of human trafficking and illegal migration. However, human trafficking in the Southeast Asian region in general and Vietnam in particular, has been still occurring more complex and unforeseeable. This battle needs more cooperative activities among international, regional and national agencies, particularly to LEAs of all countries in ASEAN. For Vietnam, the Government should order the Ministry of Public Security to enhance control and manage all entry and exit' points as well as coordinate with the Border Guard to implement the operational plan, take initiative in grasping the situation and concentrating things check and collect and supplement information on key geographical areas, routes, lines, organizations and individuals with suspicious signs of people buying and selling activities. Strengthen border patrol and control and export and entry management, timely detect and prevent criminals from trafficking and exploiting illegal migrants to sell. Promote propaganda in critical areas so that each citizen understands the crime of trafficking in people, thereby raising vigilance to prevent themselves and their families. This is a complicated and challenging work which requires the determination of the departments, branches, and localities to perform the task better.

## **8. References**

- i. Anh, Kim Duong. (2014). Engendering the evaluation of anti-trafficking policy: The Vietnamese National Action Programme against trafficking in women and children 2004-2010. (PhD in Women's and Gender Studies), The University of Waikato, Halmiton, New Zealand.
- ii. Beadle, Debbie, & Davison, Leah. (2019). Precarious Journeys: Mapping Vulnerabilities of Victims of Trafficking from Vietnam to Europe. Retrieved from London: <https://www.antislavery.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Precarious-Journeys-Mapping-vulnerabilities-of-victims-of-trafficking-from-Vietnam-to-Europe.pdf>
- iii. Blue Dragon. (2018). Human Trafficking in Vietnam. Retrieved from Hanoi, Vietnam: <https://www.bluedragon.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/04/Human-Trafficking-in-Vietnam-fact-sheet.pdf>

- iv. Campell, Denis, & Davison, Nicola. (2012). *Illegal Kidney Trade Booms as New Organ Is 'Sold Every Hour'*. World. 28 May. Retrieved from <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2012/may/27/kidney-trade-illegal-operations-who>
- v. Department of State. (2018). *Trafficking in Persons Report*. Retrieved from Washington D.C.: <https://www.state.gov/documents/organization/282798.pdf>
- vi. ECPAT. (2016). *Global Study on Sexual Exploitation of Children in Travel and Tourism: Regional Report - Southeast Asia*. Retrieved from Bangkok, Thailand:
- vii. Hoang, Tien Le. (2017). *Human Trafficking in Vietnam: Preventing Crime and Protecting Victims through Inter-agency Cooperation*. (PhD thesis), Queensland University of Technology, Queensland, Australia.
- viii. Hoang, Tien Le, Carrington, Kerry, Hung, Thanh Tran, Phuc, Thanh Nguyen, Kien, Trung Le, & Ha, Ngoc Bui. (2018). *Inter-Agency Cooperation to Raise Awareness on Human Trafficking in Vietnam: Good Practices and Challenges*. *Asian Journal of Criminology*, 13(3), 251-274.
- ix. Hoang, Tien Le, Thanh, Van Trinh, & Anh, Ngoc Cao. (2015). *Self-Help Groups for Human Trafficking Victims in Vietnam: An Innovative Program Model*. Paper presented at the Crime, Justice and Social Democracy International Conference, Brisbane, Queensland.
- x. Huong, Thu Le. (2015). *Trafficking in Persons in Vietnam: the Root Causes and State Responses to Human Security*. In Jiyoung Song & Alistair Cook (Eds.), *Irregular Migration and Human Security in East Asia* (pp. 117-135). New York: Routledge.
- xi. Kneebone, Susan, & Debeljak, Julie. (2010). *Combating Transnational Crime in the Greater Mekong Subregion: the cases of Laos and Cambodia*. In Leslie Holmes (Ed.), *Trafficking and Human Rights: European and Asia-Pacific Perspectives* (pp. 133-152). Northampton, MA: Edward Elgar Publishing.
- xii. Liberty Asia, & Blue Dragon. (2018). *Legal Gap Analysis of Anti-Trafficking Legislation in Vietnam*. Retrieved from Hanoi, Vietnam:
- xiii. MOLISA. (2018). *Training on Prevention of Trafficking in Persons* [Press release]. Retrieved from <http://www.molisa.gov.vn/vi/Pages/chitiettin.aspx?IDNews=28529>
- xiv. MPS. (2016). *Annual Report for Trafficking in Persons 2015*. Retrieved from Hanoi, Vietnam [Vietnamese language]:
- xv. MPS. (2018a). *Annual Report for Trafficking in Persons*. Retrieved from Hanoi, Vietnam [Vietnamese language]:
- xvi. MPS. (2018b). *Professional Forum on Child Trafficking Prevention* [Press release]. Retrieved from <http://bocongan.gov.vn/tin-tuc-su-kien/hoi-thao-chuyen-de-ve-nang-cao-hieu-qua-cong-tac-phong-chong-mua-ban-tre-em-d17-t24225.html>
- xvii. Ngoc, TB Nguyen. (2019). *Human Trafficking Crime Awareness Among Remote Communities in Central Vietnam*. (PhD PhD), Walden University, Minneapolis, Minnesota.
- xviii. Nhien, Cao Pham. (2016). *Preventing and Combating Women Trafficking from Vietnam to China*. (PhD Thesis), University of Northumbria, Newcastle, U.K.
- xix. Phuong, Thi Tue Hoang. (2013). *An Analysis of the Protection Regime for Trafficked Persons – From the International to Vietnam*. (PhD), Monash University, Melbourne, Australia.
- xx. Phuong, Thi Tue Hoang. (2015). *Protection for Trafficked Persons in Viet Nam: Another National Security Discourse*. *International Migration*, 53(4), 25-36.
- xxi. Stockl, Heidi, Kiss, Ligia, Hoehler, Jobst, Dung, Thuy Dong, & Zimmerman, Cathy. (2017). *Trafficking of Vietnamese Women and Girls for Marriage in China*. *Global Health Research and Policy*, 2(28), 1-9.
- xxii. Tuan, Anh Do, & Thanh, Thi Dang. (2013). *Human Trafficking in Vietnam: Difficulties and Solutions*. In Caroline Taylor, Daniel Torpy, & Dillip Das (Eds.), *Policing Global Movement: Tourism, Migration, Human Trafficking and Terrorism* (pp. 165-186). New York: CRC Press.
- xxiii. UNODC. (2014). *Child Sexual Exploitation in Travel and Tourism: An Analysis of Domestic Legal Frameworks*. Retrieved from
- xxiv. UNODC. (2016). *Assessment Toolkit: Trafficking in Persons for the Purpose of Organ Removal*. Retrieved from New York: [https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/2015/UNODC\\_Assessment\\_Toolkit\\_TIP\\_for\\_the\\_Purpose\\_of\\_Organ\\_Removal.pdf](https://www.unodc.org/documents/human-trafficking/2015/UNODC_Assessment_Toolkit_TIP_for_the_Purpose_of_Organ_Removal.pdf)
- xxv. UNODC. (2018). *Global Report on Trafficking in Persons 2018*. Retrieved from New York: [https://www.unodc.org/documents/data-and-analysis/glotip/2018/GLOTIP\\_2018\\_BOOK\\_web\\_small.pdf](https://www.unodc.org/documents/data-and-analysis/glotip/2018/GLOTIP_2018_BOOK_web_small.pdf)
- xxvi. VACR, & ECAPT. (2018). *Sexual Exploitation of Children in Vietnam for the Universal Periodic Review of the Human Rights Situation in Vietnam to the Human Rights Council 32th Session (January-February 2019) UPR Third Cycle 2017 – 2021* [Press release]
- xxvii. Viet Nam News. (2016). *Vietnam Faces Growing Human Trafficking to China*. Southeast Asia. 24 October. Retrieved from <https://www.thejakartapost.com/seasia/2016/10/24/vietnam-faces-growing-human-trafficking-to-china.html>